

September 18, 2024

To: Mayor and Members of City Council

From: Sheryl M.M. Long, City Manager **202402024**

Subject: **Communication Response re Councilmember Motion Report on the Composition of the Workforce Engaged in City Projects**

Document No. 202401327

The City Council at its session May 6, 2024, referred the following item for report:

MOTION, submitted by Councilmembers Jeffreys, Parks, Walsh and Albi, To understand the make-up of the "boots on the ground" workforce in City projects, WE MOVE that, the Administration use aggregated certified payroll data over the past few years to report back to Council within sixty (60) days.

Introduction

On May 6, 2024, the City Council introduced Motion No. 202401327 (the "Motion"), directing the City Administration to prepare a report within sixty (60) days to analyze the composition of the workforce engaged in City projects. The Motion specifically requested that the Administration use aggregated certified payroll data to provide insights on the following:

- The overall percentage of minority workers across all trades and projects.
- The overall percentage of women workers across all trades and projects.
- A breakdown of workers residing within the City of Cincinnati, the Greater Cincinnati area, and outside the region (e.g., another state beyond the Tri-State).
- The overall percentage of union versus non-union workers, with a comparison of these metrics for minorities and women.
- Recommendations on how best to track and report progress on these metrics over time, including suggestions for workforce inclusion goals.

Certified Payroll Data

The data presented in this report is drawn from City projects subject to prevailing wage requirements, with information collected and monitored via the LCP Tracker system. Certified payroll reports capture demographic details such as race, gender, and home address. However, it is important to note that this data is self-reported by employers and is not independently verified by the City. In particular, the accuracy of employee home addresses is questionable due to potential typos and errors, which may affect the reliability of related data points.

The following chart, created with the assistance of the Office of Performance and Data Analytics (OPDA) using Power BI, utilizes data from LCP Tracker. The percentages presented are calculated based on the hours reported in certified payrolls.

Minority and Women All Trades and Projects vs Total Counts					
Minority Workers	Minority Hours	Female Workers	Female Hours	Database Total Workers	Database Total Hours
3,773	1,569,056.03	743	324,062.69	20,780	9,573,338.31
Cincinnati Worker Totals			All Cities Workers Totals		
Employee City	Count of Employee City		Employee City	Count of Employee City	
CICINNATI	2		3120 Watergate Turn	1	
			Aberdeen	10	
Total	5312		Total	22752	

Minority Worker Hours: Within the LCP Tracker system, the term "Minority" encompasses African American, Asian American, Native-American, and Hispanic workers.

According to the data, there were a total of 20,780 workers on City funded prevailing wage projects. Of those 20,780 workers, 3,773 were minorities, meaning that 18.16% of all workers on City-funded prevailing wage projects were classified as minorities. Additionally, there were 9,573,338.31 total hours worked across all City funded prevailing wage projects. Minority employees contributed 1,569,056.03 hours worked, which is 16.39% of the total hours worked on these projects. This means that minority workers were utilized on 16.39% of the available hours while making up 18.16% of the available workforce on City funded prevailing wage projects.

Female Worker Hours: Female workers represented 743 workers out of the total 20,780 workers, or 3.58% of the available workforce on City-funded prevailing wage projects. Female workers accounted for 324,062.69 of the 9,573,338.31 total hours worked across all City funded prevailing wage projects, which is 3.39% of the total hours worked on these projects. This means that female workers were utilized on 3.39% of the available hours while making up 3.58% of the available workforce on City funded prevailing wage projects.

Cincinnati Worker Totals: The data on workers residing within Cincinnati should be interpreted with caution due to the potential for inaccuracies. Employer-entered addresses are prone to errors, and variations in how "Cincinnati" is inputted (e.g., typos, abbreviations) further complicate the data. For this report, any variant of "Cincinnati" was included in the "Cincinnati Worker Totals," while all other addresses were assumed to be outside of Cincinnati. If the Council wishes to regularly report on this metric, we recommend exploring more reliable data collection methods. According to the current data, 23.35% of workers on City-funded prevailing wage projects resided within Cincinnati. Adjustments to the reporting system are being made to also capture the percentage of workers from outside the tri-state area involved in these projects.

Union Status: Unfortunately, LCP Tracker's Power BI does not currently capture data on union status, making it impossible to report on this metric. If the Council wishes to monitor union status regularly, we recommend investigating alternative methods to collect and report this information.

Conclusion and Recommendation

To effectively monitor and improve workforce diversity on City projects, the Department of Economic Inclusion recommends the following:

- **Enhance Data Collection:** Work with the LCP tracker team and OPDA to make alterations in systems or processes that ensure the accuracy and reliability of data, particularly regarding worker residence.
- **Regular Reporting:** Implement a standardized reporting schedule to consistently track workforce diversity metrics, allowing for continuous assessment and refinement of inclusion strategies. The DEI team will begin reporting on workforce demographics quarterly and is

currently developing a Workforce Demographics dashboard in collaboration with the OPDA team.

- Reevaluate Construction Workforce Goals: Based on recent findings, reassess the aspirational inclusion goals at the workforce level, including specific targets for minority and female participation. Cincinnati Municipal Code 325 (CMC 325) and City Council Resolution 21 (R-21) govern EEO requirements for City contractors. R-21 sets a standard that 11.8% of labor hours be performed by minority males, 6.9% by females, with 3.45% of those hours being minority females, across all craft trades on City construction projects within Hamilton County.

By implementing these recommendations and allowing time for the changes to take effect, DEI anticipates having a more accurate depiction of workforce demographics by fiscal year 2026

cc: Natasha S. Hampton, Assistant City Manager
 Laura Castillo, Director, Department of Economic Inclusion
 Jonah James, Development Manager, Department of Economic Inclusion