

EMERGENCY

City of Cincinnati

TJL

BWB

An Ordinance No. _____ - 2020

APPROVING AND AUTHORIZING the City Manager to execute a *Community Reinvestment Area Tax Exemption Agreement (LEED or Living Building Challenge)* with Graphite Oakley, LLC, thereby authorizing a 12-year tax exemption for 100% of the value of improvements made to real property located at 2980 Disney Street in the Oakley neighborhood of Cincinnati, in connection with the construction of five new buildings into enclosed parking on the first floor, consisting of approximately 564 parking spaces, and approximately 360,828 square feet of residential rental space on the upper floors, consisting of approximately 316 apartments, which construction shall be completed in compliance with Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design Silver, Gold or Platinum standards or Living Building Challenge standards, at a total construction cost of approximately \$35,569,369.

WHEREAS, to encourage the development of real property and the acquisition of personal property, the Council of the City of Cincinnati by Ordinance No. 274-2017 passed on September 27, 2017, designated the area within the corporate boundaries of the City of Cincinnati as a “Community Reinvestment Area” pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Sections 3735.65 through 3735.70 (the “Statute”); and

WHEREAS, Ordinance No. 275-2017 passed by this Council on September 27, 2017, as amended by Ordinance No. 339-2018, passed by this Council on October 31, 2018 (as amended, the “Commercial Policy Ordinance”), sets forth certain additional policies, conditions, and limitations regarding newly constructed or remodeled commercial and residential structures in the Community Reinvestment Area; and

WHEREAS, to encourage the development of real property in a more environmentally-friendly manner, the Commercial Policy Ordinance incentivizes: (i) construction and remodeling to Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (“LEED”) standards (as defined by the U.S. Green Building Council); and (ii) construction and remodeling that obtains (a) Living Building Challenge Net Zero certification, (b) Living Building Challenge Full certification, or (c) solely in circumstances where the construction or remodeling complies with the requirements of the “Energy Petal” of the Living Building Challenge, Living Building Challenge Petal certification, in each case as defined by the International Living Future Institute and the Cascadia Green Building Council (collectively, “LBC” standards), all pursuant to the Statute; and

WHEREAS, effective October 23, 2017, the Director of Development of the State of Ohio determined that the area within the corporate boundaries of the City of Cincinnati contains the characteristics set forth in the Statute and confirmed such area as a Community Reinvestment Area under the Statute; and

WHEREAS, Graphite Oakley, LLC (the “Company”) desires to construct five new buildings into enclosed parking on the first floor, consisting of approximately 564 parking spaces, and approximately 360,828 square feet of residential rental space on the upper floors, consisting of approximately 316 apartments on real property at 2980 Disney Street located within the corporate boundaries of the City of Cincinnati, to LEED or LBC standards (the “Improvements”), provided that the appropriate development incentives are available to support the economic viability of the Improvements; and

WHEREAS, to provide an appropriate development incentive for the Improvements, the City Manager has recommended a *Community Reinvestment Area Tax Exemption Agreement (LEED or Living Building Challenge)*, in substantially the form of Attachment A to this ordinance, to authorize a real property tax exemption for the Improvements in accordance with the Statute; and

WHEREAS, the property is located within the Cincinnati City School District of the City of Cincinnati; and

WHEREAS, the Board of Education of the Cincinnati City School District (the “Board of Education”), pursuant to that certain *Tax Incentive Agreement* effective as of April 28, 2020 (as may be amended, the “Board of Education Agreement”), has approved exemptions of up to 100% of Community Reinvestment Area projects, waived advance notice and the right to review such projects, and waived sharing or allocation of municipal income taxes in connection with such projects; and

WHEREAS, pursuant to the Board of Education Agreement, the Company has entered into (or will enter into) an agreement with the Board of Education requiring the Company to pay the Board of Education amounts equal to 33% of the exempt real property taxes; and

WHEREAS, the Company has represented that it has entered into (or will enter into) a voluntary tax incentive contribution agreement with a third-party organization for amounts equal to 15% of the exempt real property taxes, which funds shall be committed by the third-party organization to facilitate permanent improvements and neighborhood services furthering redevelopment in the neighborhood of the Improvements and to support affordable housing on a City-wide basis; and

WHEREAS, the Improvements do not involve relocation of part or all of the Company’s operations from another county or municipal corporation in Ohio or, if there is relocation, notice has been given per Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.673; now, therefore,

BE IT ORDAINED by the Council of the City of Cincinnati, State of Ohio:

Section 1. That Council approves a *Community Reinvestment Area Tax Exemption Agreement (LEED or Living Building Challenge)* with Graphite Oakley, LLC (the “Agreement”), thereby authorizing a 12-year tax exemption for 100% of the assessed value of improvements to be made to real property located at 2980 Disney Street in Cincinnati, as calculated by the Hamilton County Auditor, in connection with the construction of five new buildings into enclosed parking on the first floor, consisting of approximately 564 parking spaces, and approximately 360,828 square feet of residential rental space on the upper floors, consisting of approximately 316 apartments, to be constructed in compliance with Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design Silver, Gold or Platinum standards (as defined by the U.S. Green Building Council) or Living Building Challenge standards (as described in the Agreement and as determined by the International Living Future Institute and the Cascadia Green Building Council, as applicable) at a total construction cost of approximately \$35,569,369.

Section 2. That Council authorizes the City Manager:

- (i) to execute the Agreement on behalf of the City in substantially the form of Attachment A to this ordinance; and
- (ii) to forward on behalf of Council a copy of the Agreement, within fifteen (15) days after execution, to the Director of the Ohio Development Services Agency in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(F); and
- (iii) to submit on behalf of Council annual reports on the Agreement to the Director of the Ohio Development Services Agency and to the Board of Education of the Cincinnati City School District of the City of Cincinnati, in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.672; and
- (iv) to take all necessary and proper actions to fulfill the City’s obligations under the Agreement.

Section 3. That this ordinance shall be an emergency measure necessary for the preservation of the public peace, health, safety, and general welfare and shall, subject to the terms of Article II, Section 6 of the Charter, be effective immediately. The reason for the emergency is

the immediate need to allow the construction described in this ordinance and the corresponding revitalization of the City of Cincinnati and the benefits to the City's economic welfare to begin at the earliest possible time.

Passed: _____, 2020

John Cranley, Mayor

Attest: _____
Clerk

Attachment A to Ordinance

Community Reinvestment Area Tax Exemption Agreement
(LEED or Living Building Challenge)

SEE ATTACHED

Community Reinvestment Area Tax Exemption Agreement
(LEED or Living Building Challenge)

This Community Reinvestment Area Tax Exemption Agreement (this "Agreement") is made and entered into as of the Effective Date (as defined on the signature page hereof) by and between the CITY OF CINCINNATI, an Ohio municipal corporation (the "City"), and GRAPHITE OAKLEY, LLC, an Ohio limited liability company (the "Company"), an affiliate of Hills Developers, Inc.

Recitals:

- A. The City, through the adoption of Ordinance No. 274-2017 on September 27, 2017, designated the entire City of Cincinnati as a Community Reinvestment Area to encourage the development of real property and the acquisition of personal property in that area, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Sections 3735.65 through 3735.70 (the "Statute").
- B. In accordance with the Statute, the Ohio Director of Development has forwarded to the City the Director's determination dated October 23, 2017, stating that the findings contained in Ordinance No. 274-2017 are valid and that the entire City is a Community Reinvestment Area under the Statute. By such determination, the Director of Development of the State of Ohio determined that the area within the corporate boundaries of the City of Cincinnati contains the characteristics set forth in the Statute and confirmed such area as a Community Reinvestment Area under the Statute.
- C. The Council of the City of Cincinnati has also passed Ordinance No. 275-2017 as of September 27, 2017, as amended by Ordinance No. 339-2018 passed on October 31, 2018 (the "Commercial Policy Ordinance"), which sets forth certain additional policies, conditions and limitations regarding newly constructed or remodeled commercial and residential structures in the Community Reinvestment Area.
- D. Pursuant to the Commercial Policy Ordinance, a project that is constructed or remodeled to (1) Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design ("LEED") Silver, Gold or Platinum standards (as defined by the U.S. Green Building Council), or (2) receives a (a) Living Building Challenge Net Zero certification, (b) Living Building Challenge Full certification, or (c) solely in circumstances where the construction or remodeling complies with the requirements of the "Energy Petal" of the Living Building Challenge, Living Building Challenge Petal certification, in each case as defined by the International Living Future Institute and the Cascadia Green Building Council (such qualifying remodeling or construction is referred to, collectively, as "LBC" remodeling or construction), may qualify for a longer term and/or greater abatement.
- E. The Company is the sole owner of certain real property within the City, located at 2980 Disney Street, Cincinnati, Ohio 45209 (the "Property"), as further described in Exhibit A (Legal Description of Property) hereto. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the Property shall not include any residential condominiums being developed in connection with the Project (as defined below) (the "Excluded Property"), and the Company acknowledges and agrees that the City's Community Reinvestment Area program entails separate applications by the owner of any residential condominium units included within the Project. For the avoidance of doubt, the Excluded Property shall not be exempt under this Agreement; however, this provision shall not be deemed to prohibit any owners from time to time of any Excluded Property from separately applying for a tax abatement in accordance with applicable law.
- F. The Company has proposed the construction of five new buildings located on the Property to LEED Silver standards, within the boundaries of the City of Cincinnati, as more fully described in Section 1 herein (the "Project"); provided that the appropriate development incentives are available to support the economic viability of the Project.
- G. The Statute provides that if any part of a project is to be used for commercial or industrial purposes, including projects containing four or more dwelling units, in order to be eligible for tax exemption

the City and the Company must enter into an agreement pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671 prior to commencement of construction or remodeling.

- H. The City, having appropriate authority under the Statute for this type of project, agrees (as provided herein and subject to all conditions herein) to provide the Company with the tax exemption incentives stated herein, available under the Statute, for development of the Project.
- I. The Company has submitted to the City an application for this tax exemption agreement (the "Application"), a copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit B, has remitted with the Application (i) the City application fee of One Thousand Two Hundred Fifty Dollars (\$1,250) made payable to the City and (ii) in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.672(C), the state application fee of Seven Hundred Fifty Dollars (\$750) made payable to the Ohio Development Services Agency ("ODSA"), to be forwarded to the ODSA with an executed copy of this Agreement.
- J. The Director of the City's Department of Community and Economic Development has recommended approval of the Application on the basis that the Company is qualified by financial responsibility and business experience to create and preserve employment opportunities and improve the economic climate of the City.
- K. The Board of Education of the Cincinnati City School District (the "Board of Education"), pursuant to that certain *Tax Incentive Agreement* effective as of April 28, 2020, has approved exemptions of up to one hundred percent (100%) of Community Reinvestment Area projects, waived advance notice and right to review such projects, and waived sharing or allocation of municipal income taxes in connection with such projects.
- L. The Company has entered into (or will enter into) an agreement with the Board of Education requiring the Company to pay the Board of Education amounts equal to thirty-three percent (33%) of the full amount of exempt real property taxes that would have been paid to Hamilton County if this Agreement were not in effect (the "Board of Education Agreement").
- M. The Company represents and warrants to the City that the Company and its major tenants, if any, do not intend to relocate part or all of their operations to the City from another county or municipal corporation in the State of Ohio (the "State").
- N. The Company represents that within the past five (5) years neither the Company, any related member of the Company, nor any entity to which the Company is a successor has discontinued operations at a project site in the State during the term of a property tax exemption agreement (under Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671, 5709.62, 5709.63 or 5709.632) applicable to that site, and the Company acknowledges that misrepresentation hereunder will result in voiding of this Agreement.
- O. The Company represents and warrants to the City that the Company is not subject to an Enterprise Zone Agreement with the City of Cincinnati for the Property or the Project.
- P. The Company acknowledges that the Oakley neighborhood is a rising neighborhood in need of resources for development, neighborhood improvements, amenities, and organizations oriented towards neighborhood services. The Company anticipates that future development, improvements, amenities and organizations will contribute to the quality and vitality of the neighborhood, therefore increasing the value of the Property and directly and indirectly contributing to the Project's success. The Project's success, in turn, will benefit the neighborhood. Although this feedback effect will promote the revitalization and redevelopment of the City, it could also impact the affordability of property in the area. Therefore, in support of the Oakley neighborhood and with the intention of preserving and improving the availability of quality, reliable affordable housing on a City-wide basis, as a material inducement to the City to enter into this Agreement, the Company hereby represents to the City that it will enter into a voluntary tax incentive contribution agreement ("VTICA") with a City-designated third-party non-profit administrative organization (the "Third-Party Administrator")

to contribute to the Third-Party Administrator an amount equal to fifteen percent (15%) of the real property taxes that would have been payable on the abated property but for the City-authorized tax abatement (the "VTICA Contribution"). Half of such VTICA Contribution is to be committed by the Third-Party Administrator to facilitate permanent improvements and neighborhood services furthering urban redevelopment in the Oakley neighborhood and the other half of such VTICA Contribution is to be committed by the Third-Party Administrator in supporting quality affordable housing on a City-wide basis. The Company hereby represents and warrants that it will pay the VTICA Contribution for the full term of the abatement.

Q. This Agreement has been authorized by Ordinance No. _____-2020, passed by Cincinnati City Council on _____, 2020.

R. In determining to recommend and authorize this Agreement, the Department of Community and Economic Development and City Council, respectively, have acted in material reliance on the Company's representations in the Application and herein regarding the Project including, but not limited to, representations relating to the number of jobs to be created and/or retained by the Company, the Board of Education Agreement, the VTICA Contribution, and the Project's effect in promoting the general welfare of the people of Cincinnati by, for example, encouraging the development of real property located in the Community Reinvestment Area and thereby promoting economic growth and vitality in Cincinnati.

NOW, THEREFORE, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.67(A) and in conformity with the format required under Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671, in consideration of the mutual covenants contained herein and the benefit to be derived by the parties from the execution hereof, the parties agree as follows:

Section 1. Project. Upon issuance of the necessary zoning and building approvals, the Company agrees to construct five new buildings on the Property into enclosed parking on the first floor, consisting of approximately 564 parking spaces, and approximately 360,828 square feet of residential rental space on the upper floors, consisting of approximately 316 apartments (the "Improvements") at an estimated aggregate cost of \$35,569,369 to commence after the execution of this Agreement and to be completed no later than June 30, 2024; *provided*, however, that the Director of the Department of Community and Economic Development (the "Housing Officer") may, in his discretion, extend such deadline for a period of up to 12 months by written notice if, in the Director's judgment, the Company is proceeding in good faith towards completion. The construction shall be in compliance with applicable building code requirements and zoning regulations, as well as complying with LEED Silver standards. The Company hereby represents that it has registered with the U.S. Green Building Council with intent to certify compliance with LEED Silver standards. In addition to the foregoing, (A) the Project shall comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act, together with any and all regulations or other binding directives promulgated pursuant thereto (collectively, the "**ADA**"), and (B) if (i) any building(s) within the Project is subject to the accessibility requirements of the ADA (e.g., by constituting a "place of public accommodation" or another category of structure to which the ADA is applicable) and (ii) such building(s) is not already required to meet the Contractual Minimum Accessibility Requirements (as defined below) pursuant to the ADA, applicable building code requirements, or by any other legal requirement, then the Company shall cause such building(s) to comply with the Contractual Minimum Accessibility Requirements in addition to any requirements pursuant to the ADA and the applicable building code or legal requirement. As used herein, "**Contractual Minimum Accessibility Requirements**" means that a building shall, at a minimum, include (1) at least one point of entry (as used in the ADA), accessible from a public right of way, with respect to which all architectural barriers (as used in the ADA) to entry have been eliminated, and (2) if such accessible point of entry is not a building's primary point of entry, conspicuous signage directing persons to such accessible point of entry.

Section 2. Real Property Tax Exemption. Subject to the satisfaction of the conditions set forth in this Agreement, the City approves exemption from real property taxation, pursuant to and to the fullest extent authorized by the Statute, of 100% of the amount by which the Improvements increase the assessed value of the Property as determined by the Hamilton County Auditor, for a period of 12 years, provided that

the Company shall have entered into the Board of Education Agreement. Within 120 days after completion of the Project (unless otherwise extended in writing by the City's Housing Officer), the Company must file the appropriate application for tax exemption with the City's Housing Officer. The Company is solely responsible to take this action. Upon receipt of the application for tax exemption, the City will proceed with the exemption authorized by this Agreement. In accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.67, the exemption is conditioned on verification by the Housing Officer of (A) the completion of construction, (B) the cost of construction, (C) the facts asserted in the application for exemption, (D) compliance with LBC and/or LEED standards identified in Section 1, and (E) if a remodeled structure is a structure of historical or architectural significance as designated by the City, state or federal government, that the appropriateness of the construction has been certified in writing by the appropriate agency. If the required verification is made, the Housing Officer will forward the exemption application to the Hamilton County Auditor with the necessary certification by the Housing Officer. Subject to the conditions set forth in this Agreement, the exemption commences the first tax year for which the Improvements would first be taxable were the Improvements not exempted from taxation. The dates provided in this paragraph refer to tax years in which the subject property is assessed, as opposed to years in which taxes are billed. No exemption shall commence after tax year 2024 nor extend beyond the earlier of (i) tax year 2035 or (ii) the end of the twelfth (12th) year of exemption.

Section 3. Use; Maintenance; Inspections. The Company shall use the Property solely for the purposes described in Section 1 hereof and shall properly maintain and repair the Property throughout the period of tax exemption authorized herein. The Company authorizes the Housing Officer, or the Housing Officer's designees, to enter upon the Property as reasonably required to perform property inspections in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.68.

Section 4. Compliance with Board of Education Agreement. As a condition of the tax exemption authorized under this Agreement, the Company agrees to enter into and comply with its obligation under the Board of Education Agreement.

Section 5. Duty of Company to Pay Taxes. As required by Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(C)(2), the Company shall pay such real property taxes as are not exempted under this Agreement and are charged against the Property and shall file all tax reports and returns as required by law. If the Company fails to pay such taxes or file such returns and reports, exemptions from taxation granted or authorized under this Agreement are rescinded beginning with the year for which such taxes are charged or such reports or returns are required to be filed and continuing thereafter.

Section 6. Company Certifications Regarding Non-Delinquency of Tax Obligations. As required by Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(C)(3), the Company certifies that at the time this Agreement is executed, the Company does not owe any delinquent real or tangible personal property taxes to any taxing authority of the State, and does not owe delinquent taxes for which the Company is liable under Ohio Revised Code Chapters 5733, 5735, 5739, 5741, 5743, 5747 or 5753, or if such delinquent taxes are owed, the Company currently is paying the delinquent taxes pursuant to an undertaking enforceable by the State or an agent or instrumentality thereof, has filed a petition in bankruptcy under 101, et seq., or such a petition has been filed against the Company. For the purposes of this certification, delinquent taxes are taxes that remain unpaid on the latest day prescribed for payment without penalty under the chapter of the Ohio Revised Code governing payment of those taxes.

Section 7. Covenant of Satisfaction of Tax and Other Obligations. In accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 9.66, (A) the Company affirmatively covenants that it does not owe: (i) any delinquent taxes to the State or to a political subdivision of the State; (ii) any moneys to the State or a State agency for the administration or enforcement of any environmental laws of the State; or (iii) any other moneys to the State, a State agency or a political subdivision of the State that are past due, regardless of whether the amounts owed are being contested in a court of law or not; (B) the Company authorizes the City and/or the State to inspect the personal financial statements of the Company, including tax records and other similar information not ordinarily open to public inspection; and (C) the Company authorizes the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency and the Ohio Department of Taxation to release information to the City and or other State departments in connection with the above statements. As provided by statute, a

knowingly false statement under this section may be prosecuted as a first degree misdemeanor under Ohio Revised Code Section 2921.13, may render the Company ineligible for any future economic development assistance from the State or any political subdivision of the State, and will result in the City requiring the Company's repayment of any assistance provided by the City in connection with the Project.

Section 8. City Cooperation. As required by Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(C)(4), upon specific request from the Company, the City shall perform such acts as are reasonably necessary or appropriate to effect, claim, reserve and maintain exemptions from taxation granted under this Agreement including, without limitation, joining in the execution of all documentation and providing any necessary certificates required in connection with such exemptions.

Section 9. Continuation of Exemptions. As provided in Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(C)(5), if for any reason the City revokes the designation of the City of Cincinnati as a Community Reinvestment Area, entitlements granted under this Agreement shall continue for the number of years specified under this Agreement, unless the Company materially fails to fulfill its obligations under this Agreement and the City terminates or modifies the exemptions from taxation authorized pursuant to this Agreement.

Section 10. City Not Liable. The Company acknowledges that the exemption authorized in this Agreement is subject to approval and implementation by the appropriate state and/or county taxing authorities. The Company acknowledges that the City does not give any guarantee or assurance that the exemption approved in this Agreement will be so approved, and the Company agrees that in no event shall the Company seek to hold the City liable in any way in the event such exemption is not granted or implemented.

Section 11. Small Business Enterprise Program.¹

A. Compliance with Small Business Enterprise Program. The policy of the City is that a fair share of contracts be awarded to Small Business Enterprises (as such term is defined in Cincinnati Municipal Code ("CMC") Section 323-1-S, "SBEs"). Pursuant to CMC Section 323-11, the City's annual goal for SBE participation shall be thirty percent (30%) of the City's total dollars spent for construction (as such term is defined in CMC Section 323-1-C4), supplies (as such term is defined in CMC Section 323-1-S5), services (as such term is defined in CMC Section 323-1-S) and professional services (as such term is defined in CMC Section 323-1-P2). Accordingly, the Company shall use its best efforts and take affirmative steps to achieve the City's goal of voluntarily meeting thirty percent (30%) SBE participation. A list of SBEs may be obtained from the City's Department of Economic Inclusion. The Company may refer interested firms to the City's Department of Economic Inclusion for review and possible certification as an SBE. The Company shall comply with the provisions of CMC Chapter 323, including without limitation taking at least the following affirmative steps:

- (i) Including qualified SBEs on solicitation lists.
- (ii) Assuring that SBEs are solicited whenever they are potential sources. The Company must advertise, on at least two separate occasions, both in local minority publications and in other local newspapers of general circulation, invitations to SBEs to provide services, to supply materials, or to bid on construction contracts, as applicable.
- (iii) When economically feasible, dividing total requirements into small tasks or quantities so as to permit maximum SBE participation.
- (iv) If any subcontracts are to be let, the Company shall require the prime contractor (if different from the Company) to take the above affirmative steps.
- (v) Prior to the commencement of work under any subcontracts, the Company shall provide to the City a list of such subcontractors, including information as to the dollar amount of the subcontracts and such other information as may be requested by the City. The Company shall update the report monthly.

¹ Note: this section will be revised prior to execution due to programmatic changes being implemented by the Department of Community and Economic Development as a result of recent legislation passed by City Council.

(vi) The Company shall periodically document its best efforts and affirmative steps to meet the above SBE participation goals by submitting such information as may be requested from time to time by the City.

B. Remedies for Noncompliance with Small Business Enterprise Program. Failure of the Company or its contractors and subcontractors to take the affirmative steps specified above, to provide fair and equal opportunity to SBEs, or to provide technical assistance to SBEs as may be necessary to reach SBE participation as set out in CMC Chapter 323 may be construed by the City as failure of the Company to use its best efforts, and, in addition to other remedies under this Agreement, may be a cause for the City to file suit in Common Pleas Court to enforce specific performance of the terms of this Section. The provisions of CMC Section 323-99 are hereby incorporated by reference into this Agreement.

Section 12. Jobs. The Company represents that, as of the date of the execution of this Agreement, the Company has no existing employment at the Property or in the State.

Section 13. Job Creation and Retention.

A. Jobs to be Created by Company. The Company agrees to use its best efforts to create (i) 4 full-time equivalent permanent jobs and (ii) 40 full-time temporary construction jobs at the Property in connection with the Project. In the case of the construction jobs, the job creation and retention period shall be concurrent with construction, and in the case of the other jobs described herein, the job creation period shall begin upon completion of construction and shall end three (3) years thereafter.

B. Company's Estimated Payroll Increase. The Company's increase in the number of employees will result in approximately (i) \$200,000 of additional annual payroll with respect to the full-time equivalent permanent jobs and (ii) \$2,500,000 of additional annual payroll prior to the completion of the Project with respect to the full-time temporary construction jobs.

C. Community Reinvestment Area Employment. The Company shall (i) adopt hiring practices to ensure that at least twenty-five percent (25%) of the new employees shall be residents of the City of Cincinnati and (ii) give preference to residents of the City relative to residents of the State who do not reside in the City when hiring new employees under this Agreement.

D. Posting Available Employment Opportunities. To the extent allowable by law, the Company shall use its best efforts to post available employment opportunities within the Company's organization or the organization of any subcontractor working with the Company with the Ohio Means Jobs Center, 1916 Central Parkway, Cincinnati, Ohio 45214-2305, through its Employer Services Unit Manager at 513-746-7200.

Section 14. Equal Employment Opportunity. This Agreement is subject to the City's Equal Employment Opportunity Program contained in CMC Chapter 325. The Equal Employment Opportunity Clause in CMC Section 325-9 is incorporated by reference in this Agreement. The term "Company" is substituted for "Contractor" throughout CMC Section 325-9 in the context of this Agreement.

Section 15. Compliance with Immigration and Nationality Act. In the performance of its obligations under this Agreement, the Company agrees to comply with the provisions of the Immigration and Nationality Act codified at 8 U.S.C. §§ 1324a(a)(1)(A) and (a)(2). Any noncompliance with such provisions shall be solely determined by either the federal agencies authorized to enforce the Immigration and Nationality Act or the U.S. Attorney General, in accordance with Executive Order 12989 of the U.S. President dated February 13, 1996, and as amended by Executive Order 13465 of the U.S. President dated June 6, 2008.

Section 16. Default. As provided in Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(C)(6), if the Company materially fails to fulfill its obligations under this Agreement, or if the City determines that the

certification as to delinquent taxes required by this Agreement (Section 6 hereof) or the covenant of satisfaction of tax and other obligations (Section 7 hereof) is fraudulent, the City may terminate or modify the exemptions from taxation granted or authorized under this Agreement and may require the repayment by the Company of the amount of taxes that would have been payable had the Improvements not been exempted from taxation pursuant to this Agreement. A modification of exemption may be in the form of reduction in the number of years that eligible property is exempt and/or a reduction in the exemption percentage. The City shall provide written notice to the Company prior to finding the Company in default under this section. The notice shall provide the Company with not less than thirty (30) days to cure the default prior to City termination or modification of the exemptions under this Agreement. The City may extend the cure period as reasonably necessary under the circumstances. In the event of such termination or modification, the City is authorized to so notify the appropriate taxing authorities in order to effect the termination or modification. If repayment of previously exempt taxes is required by the City under this Section, such amount shall be paid as directed by the City within thirty (30) days of written demand. The City may secure repayment of such taxes by a lien on the Property in the amount required to be repaid. Such a lien shall attach, and may be perfected, collected, and enforced, in the same manner as a mortgage lien on real property, and shall otherwise have the same force and effect as a mortgage lien on real property. Amounts due and not paid when due under this Section 16 shall bear interest at the rate specified in Ohio Revised Code Section 1343.03(A) (as in effect on the date of the City's payment demand).

Section 17. Annual Review and Report. As required by Ohio Revised Code Sections 3735.671(C)(7) and 5709.85, the Company shall provide to the City's Tax Incentive Review Council (or to the City Manager if so requested by the City) any information reasonably required by the Council or the City Manager to evaluate the Company's compliance with this Agreement, including returns filed pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 5711.02 if requested by the Council or City Manager. The performance of the Company's obligations stated in this Agreement shall be subject to annual review by the City's Tax Incentive Review Council (the "Annual Review and Report"). The Company shall submit information for the Annual Review and Report to the City no later than March 1 of each year.

Section 18. Revocation.

A. Generally. Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.68, the housing officer shall make annual inspections of the properties within the community reinvestment area upon which are located structures or remodeling for which an exemption has been granted under Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.67. If the housing officer finds that the property has not been properly maintained or repaired due to the neglect of the Company, the housing officer may revoke the exemption at any time after the first year of exemption. If the Company has materially failed to fulfill its obligations under this Agreement, or if the owner is determined to have violated division (E) of that section (see Section 18(B) of this Agreement), City Council, subject to the terms of the agreement, may revoke the exemption at any time after the first year of exemption. The housing officer or City Council shall notify the county auditor and the Company that the tax exemption no longer applies. If the housing officer or legislative authority revokes a tax exemption, the housing officer shall send a report of the revocation to the community reinvestment area housing council and to the tax incentive review council established pursuant to section 3735.69 or 5709.85 of the Revised Code, containing a statement of the findings as to the maintenance and repair of the property, failure to fulfill obligations under the written agreement, or violation of division (E) of Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671, and the reason for revoking the exemption.

B. Prior Statutory Violations. The Company represents and warrants to the City that it is not prohibited by Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(E) from entering into this Agreement. As required by Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(C)(9), exemptions from taxation granted or authorized under this Agreement shall be revoked if it is determined that the Company, any successor to the Company or any related member (as those terms are defined in division (E) of Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671) has violated the prohibition against entering into this Agreement under division (E) of Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671 or under Ohio Revised Code Sections 5709.62 or 5709.63 prior to the time prescribed by that division or either of those sections.

Section 19. False Statements; Penalties; Material Representations.

A. Generally. As required in connection with Ohio Revised Code Section 9.66(C), the Company affirmatively covenants that it has made no false statements to the State or the City in the process of obtaining approval for this Agreement. If any representative of the Company has knowingly made a false statement to the State or the City to obtain approval for this Agreement, or if the Company fails to provide any information expressly required under the Application, the Company shall be required to immediately return all benefits received under this Agreement (by payment of the amount of taxes exempted hereunder, paid as directed by the City within thirty (30) days of written demand) and the Company shall be ineligible for any future economic development assistance from the State, any State agency or any political subdivision of the State pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 9.66(C)(1). Amounts due and not paid under this Section 19 shall bear interest at the rate of twelve percent (12%) per year. Any person who provides a false statement to secure economic development assistance (as defined in Ohio Revised Code Section 9.66) may be guilty of falsification, a misdemeanor of the first degree, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 2921.13(F)(1), which is punishable by fine of not more than One Thousand Dollars (\$1,000) and/or a term of imprisonment of not more than six (6) months.

B. Material Representations – Board of Education Agreement and VTICA. The Parties acknowledge and agree that a material failure by the Company to comply with its representations concerning the Board of Education Agreement or VTICA Contribution shall constitute an event of default for purposes of Section 16 (Default) and the basis for revocation under Section 18 (Revocation). Subject to the terms of the VTICA, if the VTICA is unenforceable for reasons of infeasibility or otherwise, the Company shall enter into alternative arrangements providing for the economic equivalent of the VTICA Contribution. Such arrangements may include, but are not limited to, providing for the economic equivalent of the VTICA Contribution through formation of a special improvement district. For purposes of this Section 19.B, alternative arrangements must result in services substantially similar to those that would have been supported through the VTICA and at a value that is the economic equivalent of the VTICA Contribution, which value shall not be required to exceed the VTICA Contribution amount that would have been payable by the Company. Any determination of infeasibility or mechanism for providing alternative arrangements is subject to approval by the City at its sole discretion. Nothing in this Section 19.B shall operate to limit the City's enforcement authority under this Agreement including, without limitation, Section 16, Section 18, and Section 19.A.

Section 20. Conflict of Interest. The Company covenants that, to the Company's knowledge, no employee of the City has any personal interest, direct or indirect, in any matters pertaining to the Project, and the Company agrees to take appropriate steps to prevent any employee of the City from obtaining any such interest throughout the term of this Agreement.

Section 21. Annual Fee. As authorized by Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(D), the Company shall pay an annual fee of Five Hundred Dollars (\$500) or one percent (1%) of the annual taxes exempted under this Agreement, whichever is greater, but not to exceed Two Thousand, Five Hundred Dollars (\$2,500) per annum. This fee is due with submission of the information for Annual Review and Report by March 1 of each year.

Section 22. Discontinued Operations. As provided in Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(E), if, prior to the expiration of the term of this Agreement, the Company discontinues operations at the Project so that the Property is no longer being used for the purposes described in Section 1 hereof, then the Company, its successors, and any related member shall not enter into an agreement under Ohio Revised Code Sections 3735.671, 5709.62, 5709.63 or 5709.632, and no legislative authority shall enter into such an agreement with the Company, its successors or any related member prior to the expiration of five (5) years after the discontinuation of operations. As used in this Section 22, "successors" and "related member" shall have the meanings set forth in Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(E).

Section 23. Notices. Unless otherwise specified herein, each party shall address written notices, demands and communications in connection with this Agreement to the other party as follows (or to such other address as is communicated in accordance with this Section):

To the City:

City of Cincinnati
Attention: Director of the Department of Community and Economic Development
Centennial Plaza Two, Suite 700
805 Central Avenue
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

To the Company:

Graphite Oakley, LLC
Attention: Louis Guttman
4901 Hunt Road, Suite 300
Cincinnati, Ohio 45242

With a copy to:

Graphite Oakley, LLC
Attention: Harry Schneider, Esq.
4901 Hunt Road, Suite 300
Cincinnati, OH 45242

If the Company sends a notice to the City alleging that the City is in default under this Agreement, the Company shall simultaneously send a copy of such notice to: City Solicitor, City of Cincinnati, 801 Plum Street, Room 214, Cincinnati, OH 45202.

Section 24. Acknowledgment of City Participation. The Company agrees to acknowledge the support of the City on construction signs, project and exhibition signage, and any publicity such as that appearing on the internet, television, cable television, radio, or in the press or any other printed media. In identifying the City as a Project partner, the Company shall use either the phrase "Project Assistance by the City of Cincinnati" or a City of Cincinnati logotype or other form of acknowledgement that has been approved in advance in writing by the City.

Section 25. Entire Agreement. This Agreement and the Exhibits attached hereto constitute the entire agreement between the City and the Company with respect to the subject matter herein, superseding any prior or contemporaneous agreement with respect thereto.

Section 26. Governing Law. This Agreement is entered into and is to be performed in the State. The City and the Company agree that the law of the State of Ohio shall govern the rights, obligations, duties and liabilities of the parties to this Agreement and shall govern the interpretation of this Agreement.

Section 27. Waiver. The City's waiver of any breach by the Company of any provision of this Agreement shall not constitute or operate as a waiver by the City of any other breach of such provision or of any other provisions, nor shall any failure or delay by the City to enforce any provision hereof operate as a waiver of such provision or of any other provision.

Section 28. Severability. This Agreement shall be severable; if any part or parts of this Agreement shall for any reason be held invalid or unenforceable by a court of competent jurisdiction, all remaining parts shall remain binding and in full force and effect.

Section 29. Amendment. This Agreement may be modified or amended only by a written agreement duly executed by the parties hereto or their representatives.

Section 30. Non-Assignment. As required by Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(C)(8), this Agreement is not transferable or assignable by the Company without the express written approval of the City Manager of the City. If the Company has entered into a Board of Education Agreement or VTICA in connection with the Property, the City shall not approve the assignment of this Agreement unless the assignee has assumed the Company's remaining obligations under the Board of Education Agreement and VTICA, as applicable. Failure to assign or otherwise perform the Company's obligations under the Board of Education Agreement or VTICA upon transfer of the Property during the term of the tax abatement authorized by this Agreement shall be basis for revocation of the tax exemption under Section 18.

Section 31. Recording. At its election, the City may record this Agreement at the City's expense in the Hamilton County Recorder's Office.

Section 32. Legislative Action Required. As provided in Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.671(C)(10), the Company and the City acknowledge that this Agreement must be approved by formal action of the City Council of the City as a condition for this Agreement to take effect. Notwithstanding anything to the contrary herein, this Agreement shall take effect after the later of the date of such approval or the final date of execution of this Agreement by all parties.

Section 33. Additional Representations and Warranties of Company. The Company represents and warrants that (a) it is duly organized and existing and it has full power and authority to take, and has taken, all action necessary to execute and deliver this Agreement and any other documents required or permitted to be executed or delivered by it in connection with this Agreement, and to fulfill its obligations hereunder; (b) no notices to, or consents, authorizations or approvals of, any person are required (other than any already given or obtained) for its due execution, delivery and performance of this Agreement; and (c) this Agreement has been duly executed and delivered by it and constitutes the legal, valid and binding obligation of the Company.

Section 34. Certification as to Non-Debarment. The Company represents that neither it nor any of its principals is presently debarred by any federal, state, or local government agency. In completing the Project, the Company shall not solicit bids from any contractors or subcontractors who are identified as being debarred by any federal, state, or local government agency. If the Company or any of its principals becomes debarred by any federal, state, or local government agency during the term of this Agreement, the company shall be considered in default under this Agreement.

Section 35. Appeals. Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 3735.70, a person aggrieved under the Statute or this Agreement may appeal to the community reinvestment area housing council, which shall have the authority to overrule any decision of a housing officer. Appeals may be taken from a decision of the council to the court of common pleas of the county where the area is located.

Section 36. Wage Enforcement.

(i) Applicability. Council passed Ordinance No. 22-2016 on February 3, 2016, which ordained Chapter 326 (Wage Enforcement) of the Cincinnati Municipal Code (the "Wage Enforcement Chapter"). The Wage Enforcement Chapter was then amended by Ordinance No. 96-2017, passed May 17, 2017. As amended, the Wage Enforcement Chapter imposes certain requirements upon persons entering into agreements with the City whereby the City provides an incentive or benefit that is projected to exceed \$25,000, as described more particularly in the Wage Enforcement Chapter. Cincinnati Municipal Code Section 326-5 requires that the language below be included in contracts subject to the Wage Enforcement Chapter.

(ii) Required Contractual Language. Capitalized terms used, but not defined, in this clause (ii) have the meanings ascribed thereto in the Wage Enforcement Chapter.

(a) This contract is or may be subject to the Wage Enforcement provisions of the Cincinnati Municipal Code. These provisions require that any Person who has an Agreement with the

city or with a Contractor or Subcontractor of that Person shall report all Complaints or Adverse Determinations of Wage Theft and Payroll Fraud (as each of those terms is defined in Chapter 326 of the Cincinnati Municipal Code) against the Contractor or Subcontractors to the Department of Economic Inclusion within 30 days of notification of the Complaint or Adverse Determination.

(b) If this contract is subject to the Wage Enforcement provisions of Chapter 326 of the Cincinnati Municipal Code, the Person entering into this contract is required to include provisions in solicitations and contracts regarding a Development Site that all employers, Contractors or Subcontractors performing or proposing to perform work on a Development Site provide an initial sworn and notarized "Affidavit Regarding Wage Theft and Payroll Fraud" on a form prescribed by the city manager or his or her designee and, within 30 days of an Adverse Determination or Complaint of Wage Theft or Payroll Fraud, shall provide an "Amended Affidavit Regarding Wage Theft and Payroll Fraud" on a form prescribed by the city manager or his or her designee.

(c) If this contract is subject to the Wage Enforcement provisions of Chapter 326 of the Cincinnati Municipal Code, the Person entering into this contract is required to authorize, and does hereby specifically authorize, any local, state or federal agency, court, administrative body or other entity investigating a complaint of Wage Theft or Payroll Fraud against the Person (collectively "investigative bodies") to release to the City's Department of Economic Inclusion any and all evidence, findings, complaints and determinations associated with the allegations of Wage Theft or Payroll Fraud upon the City's request and further authorizes such investigative bodies to keep the City advised regarding the status of the investigation and ultimate determination. If the investigative bodies require the Person to provide additional authorization on a prescribed form or in another manner, the Person shall be required to provide such additional authorization within 14 days of a request by the City.

(d) If this Agreement is subject to the Wage Enforcement provisions of Chapter 326 of the Cincinnati Municipal Code, the Person entering into this Agreement shall include in its contracts with all Contractors language that requires the Contractors to provide the authorizations set forth in subsection (c) above and that further requires each Contractor to include in its contracts with Subcontractors those same obligations for each Subcontractor and each lower tier subcontractor.

(e) If this Agreement is subject to the Wage Enforcement provisions of Chapter 326 of the Cincinnati Municipal Code, the Person entering into this Agreement shall post a conspicuous notice on the Development Site throughout the entire period work is being performed pursuant to the Agreement indicating that the work being performed is subject to Cincinnati Municipal Code Chapter 326, Wage Enforcement, as administered by the City of Cincinnati Department of Economic Inclusion. Such notice shall include contact information for the Department of Economic Inclusion as provided by the department.

(f) Under the Wage Enforcement provisions, the City shall have the authority, under appropriate circumstances, to terminate this contract or to reduce the incentives or subsidies to be provided under this contract and to seek other remedies, including debarment.

Section 37. Legal Requirements. In completing and operating the Project, the Company shall comply with all applicable statutes, ordinances, regulations, and rules of the government of the United States, State of Ohio, County of Hamilton, and City of Cincinnati.

Section 38. Counterparts and Electronic Signatures. This Agreement may be executed by the parties hereto in two or more counterparts and each executed counterpart shall be considered an original but all of which together shall constitute one and the same instrument. This Agreement may be executed and delivered by electronic signature; any original signatures that are initially delivered electronically shall be physically delivered as soon as reasonably possible.

Remainder of this page intentionally left blank. Signature page follows.

Executed by the parties on the dates indicated below, effective as of the later of such dates (the "Effective Date").

CITY OF CINCINNATI,
an Ohio municipal corporation

GRAPHITE OAKLEY, LLC,
an Ohio limited liability company

By: _____
Paula Boggs Muething, Interim City Manager

By _____
Louis Guttman, President

Date: _____, 2020

Date: _____, 2020

Authorized by resolution dated _____

Approved as to Form:

Assistant City Solicitor

Certified Date: _____

Fund/Code: _____

Amount: _____

By: _____
Karen Alder, City Finance Director

Exhibit A to CRA Agreement

LEGAL DESCRIPTION OF PROPERTY

Street Address: 2980 Disney Street, Cincinnati, OH 45209

Situate in Section 28, Town 4, Range 2, City of Cincinnati, Hamilton County, Ohio, being all of Lot 1 (Parcel No. 052-0001-0022), Lot 2 (Parcel No. 052-0001-0023), and Lot 6 (Parcel No. 052-0001-0027), of the Cast Fab Subdivision as recorded in Plat Book 473, Pages 49-50 of the Plat of Records of Hamilton County as conveyed to Local Oakley, LLC in O.R. 13820, Page 1995 in the Hamilton County recorder's office, and being a 0.1986 Acre Tract (Parcel No. 052-0002-0025) conveyed to Local Oakley, LLC in Hamilton County, Ohio recorded in O.R. 14032, Page 2815 in said Hamilton County Ohio, recorder's office, being further described as follows;

Beginning at a point in the centerline intersection of Disney Street (R.O.W. varies) and Local Oakley Drive (R.O.W. varies);

Thence, with a proposed zoning line and the centerline of said of Local Oakley Drive, along the following four (4) courses:

- 1) North 84°04'23" West, 99.10 feet to a point;
- 2) On curve to the right having a radius of 300.00 feet, an arc distance of 82.58 feet, a delta angle of 15°11'16", the Chord bears, North 76°11'16" West, 82.32 feet to a point;
- 3) North 68°18'08" West, 842.71 feet to a point;
- 4) North 21°41'39" East, 73.86 feet to a point in the proposed zoning line and a line of a 5.3184 Acre Tract as conveyed to Milacron, LLC, in O.R. 11233, Page 1847 in the Hamilton County Ohio, recorder's office Ohio;

Thence, along the proposed zoning line, and with the southerly line of said 5.3184 Acre Tract, along the following ten (10)

- 1) South 84°08'04" East, 97.69 feet to a point;
- 2) North 06°22'53" East, 207.07 feet to a point;
- 3) North 57°50'53" East, 62.64 feet to a point;
- 4) South 83°37'07" East, 61.15 feet to a point;
- 5) South 05°38'31" West, 22.27 feet to a point;
- 6) South 87°05'09" East, 67.60 feet to a point;
- 7) South 84°19'07" East, 302.37 feet to a point;
- 8) South 05°40'53" West, 36.00 feet to a point;
- 9) South 84°19'07" East, 288.92 feet to a point;
- 10) South 55°11'32" East, 211.90 feet to a point in the centerline of said Disney Street;

Thence with the proposed zoning line and the centerline of said Disney Street, along the following two(2) courses and distances:

- 1) On curve to the left having a radius of 501.48 feet, an arc distance of 294.43 feet, a delta angle of 33°38'23", the chord bears, South 22°35'03" West, 290.22 feet to a point;
- 2) South 05°45'54" West, 124.16 feet to the POINT of BEGINNING.

Containing 9.1317 acres of land more or less.

The above description was prepared from a Zoning Plat by McGill Smith Punshon, Inc. dated 05/10/20. The bearings in the above description are based Plat Book 473, Pages 49-50, Hamilton County, Ohio Recorder's Office.

Exhibit B to CRA Agreement

APPLICATION FOR TAX EXEMPTION

TO BE ATTACHED TO EXECUTION VERSION