



City of Cincinnati

801 Plum Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Agenda - Final

Public Safety & Governance

Councilmember Scotty Johnson, Chair
Vice Mayor Jan-Michele Kearney, Vice Chair
Councilmember Mark Jeffreys
Councilmember Liz Keating

Tuesday, March 7, 2023

9:30 AM

Council Chambers, Room 300

AGENDA

1. [202300703](#) ORDINANCE (EMERGENCY) submitted by Sheryl M. M. Long, City Manager, on 3/1/2023, ESTABLISHING, the classification and salary range schedule for the new employment classification of the Law Fellow, and ORDAINING Section 163 of Division Law, Chapter 307, of the Cincinnati Municipal Code.

Sponsors: City Manager
Attachments: [Transmittal](#)
[Ordinance](#)

2. [202300704](#) REPORT, dated 3/1/2023, submitted Sheryl M. M. Long, City Manager, regarding Parking Enforcement, Meters & Residential Permits. REFERENCE DOCUMENT #202202004 and #202300645.

Sponsors: City Manager
Attachments: [Report](#)

3. [202300660](#) ORDINANCE (EMERGENCY) submitted by Sheryl M. M. Long, City Manager, on 2/23/2023, MODIFYING Chapter 306, "General Compensation Provisions," of the Cincinnati Municipal Code by AMENDING Section 306-7, "Special Salary Provisions," Section 306-11, "Increases and Reclassifications," and Section 306-13, "Transfers and Promotions," to conform the Cincinnati Municipal Code to evolving trends in the labor market.

Sponsors: City Manager
Attachments: [Transmittal](#)
[Ordinance](#)

March 1, 2023

To: Mayor and Members of City Council

From: Sheryl M.M. Long, City Manager

202300703

Subject: Emergency Ordinance: Establishing the Salary Range for the classification of Law Fellow

Attached is an Emergency Ordinance captioned:

ESTABLISHING, the classification and salary range schedule for the new employment classification of the Law Fellow, and **ORDAINING** Section 163 of Division Law, Chapter 307, of the Cincinnati Municipal Code.

Classification	Minimum (Annual)	Maximum (Annual)
Law Fellow	\$ 48,000	\$58,000

The Human Resources Director has approved to establish the salary schedule for the employment classification of Law Fellow. The Department of Human Resources has done due diligence and conducted appropriate internal comparisons to ensure that the new salary range is consistent with the scope of services and the level of responsibility of the position, with factors considered throughout the evaluation process including liability, scope of responsibility, judgment and independent action, and accountability. The modification of the classification is necessary to fit the needs of the City, and consistent with the organizational changes described herein.

The Administration recommends passage of this Emergency Ordinance.

cc: Edward G. Ramsey, Human Resources Director

EMERGENCY

KKF

-2023

ESTABLISHING the classification and salary range schedule for the new employment classification of Law Fellow, and **ORDAINING** Section 163 of Division Law, Chapter 307, of the Cincinnati Municipal Code.

WHEREAS, the Human Resources Department has determined the creation of the Law Fellow classification specification is necessary to fit the needs of the Law Department, to recruit and retain quality attorneys in the Law Department’s salary schedule, and to better serve Cincinnati residents; and

WHEREAS, the Law Fellow program provides opportunities to increase operational efficiencies while maintaining a standard of excellence and a clear pathway for continued growth and career progression for affected employees; and

WHEREAS, the Human Resources Department has done due diligence to ensure that the new classification and salary range is consistent with the scope of services and the level of responsibility of the position of Law Fellow, with factors considered throughout the evaluation process including scope of responsibility, judgment and independent action, and accountability; now, therefore,

BE IT **ORDAINED** by the Council of the City of Cincinnati, State of Ohio:

Section 1. That new Section 163 of Division Law, Chapter 307 of the Cincinnati Municipal Code is hereby established as shown below:

Classification	Minimum Annual	Maximum Annual
Law Fellow	\$48,000	\$58,000

Section 2. That this ordinance shall be an emergency measure necessary for the preservation of the public peace, health, safety, and general welfare and shall, subject to the terms of Article II, Section 6 of the Charter, be effective immediately. The reason for the

emergency is the immediate need to establish the classification and salary range of Law Fellow in the Law Department to recruit and retain qualified employees.

Passed: _____, 2023

Aftab Pureval, Mayor

Attest: _____
Clerk

March 1, 2023

202300704

To: Mayor and Members of City Council
From: Sheryl M.M. Long, City Manager
Subject: **COUNCIL REPORT – Parking Enforcement, Meters & Residential Permits**

REFERENCE DOCUMENT #202202004 and #202300645

The City Council referred Item # 202202004, at its session on November 2, 2022, and Item #202300645, at its session on February 15, 2023, for review and report:

MOTION #202202004

Parking Enforcement, Meters & Residential Permits

WE MOVE that, the Administration report back to council in ninety (90) days with:

- The number of parking tickets issued per year for the past five years by neighborhood [BALANCE OF MOTION ON FILE]

MOTION #202300645

Parking Enforcement, Meters & Residential Permits

WE MOVE for the Administration to engage with business owners who operate in the area around Green and Pleasant Street in Over-The-Rhine [BALANCE OF MOTION ON FILE]

ANALYSIS OF REQUESTED INFORMATION

1. The number of parking tickets issued per year for the past five years by neighborhood

See attached citation data table.

2. What resources, if any, would be needed to ensure parking rules and regulations are enforced across the city—particularly in high volume areas during peak times like the urban basin and neighborhood business districts during events, evenings, and weekends

Management of the parking system consists of staffing for enforcement, collections, and maintenance for all parking system assets. The Department of Community & Economic Development’s Parking Division (Parking Division) has sufficient staffing for all of these functions during all operating hours of the parking system. Parking enforcement is comprised of a balanced mix of routes which are generally designed around metered parking and restricted zones. These routes are then supplemented by complaint-based enforcement in various neighborhoods. Furthermore, the Parking Division works closely with Cincinnati Police Department (CPD) to staff events and special assignments. With our existing resources, the Parking Division believes that we are sufficiently enforcing within these areas. However, adding parking enforcement officers would allow for more directed enforcement, additional routes, and concentration in areas experiencing peak hour demand and safety issues. An increase in enforcement personnel would require an increase to the Parking Division staffing level and budget. The below table outlines the outcomes the costs in salary/fringe benefits and associated enforcement hours and revenue that would result. Note that these figures do not assume turnover in the positions and a full year of activity.

Parking Enforcement Officer (PEO)	Additional enforcement hours	Costs (salary, benefits)	Citation revenue	Net
4	5280	\$260,000	\$540,000	\$280,000

3. Any recommendations on how to better manage existing parking assets like meters and designated residential spaces to ensure turnover and on-street parking availability

Management of parking assets involves both up to date equipment and sufficient staffing for enforcement. One budget scenario for increasing enforcement within the on-street parking system was provided above. Related to equipment, the Parking Division is moving to reduce the City’s reliance on single space meters which have a higher cost per space to maintain than efficiently deployed multi-space kiosks and mobile payment options. This is being accomplished by expanding the purchase and

use of multi-space meter zones (kiosks), expanding the use of the City’s “mobile only” payment zones, and creating strategies to drive adoption of mobile payment options for metered parking, specifically by adding another mobile payment provider to the City’s current platform. Mobile only payment zones are the most efficient to manage as they require little physical alteration to the existing infrastructure to add or remove paid parking alternatives. The Administration can promote efficient management through parking equipment in two specific ways. First, when stakeholders request the addition of paid parking to an area where parking is presently unrestricted, the Parking Division can implement paid parking in mobile payment only zones rather than meters. Second, the Parking Division can continue replacing existing meters with multi-space kiosks and/or mobile payment zones.

Further, the Parking Division recently took over the administrative responsibility of managing the Residential Parking Permit program (RPPP) from the Department of Transportation and Engineering (DOTE). Upon taking over administration of the RPPP, the Parking Division has implemented a digital permitting system. The new system replaces the former “hang tag” system with a digital, user-managed system. The system allows for quick access to visitor permits, payments, and customer service support. The Parking Division continues to look for ways to improve the customer experience of existing residential zones through the digital system.

Finally, Parking Division is also reviewing options for creating better incentives to generate on-street parking turnover for businesses. Currently, customers cannot occupy a paid parking space for more than the marked time period, which is commonly two hours. If they exceed the marked time period, they can receive a ticket for an overtime parking violation. In many other cities, the overtime parking violation process is being replaced by tiered increase rate structure programs. The initial findings in some markets are showing positive results for both creating the desired turnover to support businesses and maximizing potential on-street parking revenue. Utilizing tiered rates can increase turnover as an alternative to increased enforcement of existing hour limitations.

4. What resources would be needed to remove defunct parking meter posts (as shown in Exhibit A of the Motion) and, if appropriate, install parking stalls in their place?

A top priority for the Parking Division in FY2024 is the removal of obsolete parking meter poles. Within the Administration, Parking Division is working with DOTE (work order creation) to identify all the defunct parking meter posts and schedule removal through the Department of Public Services (DPS). Currently there are 700-800 poles estimated in need of removal. This number will increase by 500-600 as we implement the expanded multi-space meter zones and mobile only payment pilot zones throughout the City.

Removal of defunct parking meter polls will not begin until early FY24, due to current DPS projects (including mobile parking sign upgrades) and preparation for snow operations. An estimate of completion of removal of all defunct poles is difficult due to competing DPS capacity demands and increasing number of poles needing removal; however, Parking Division estimates that the majority of currently defunct poles can be removed by the end of CY2023.

Additionally, the Parking Division is assessing alternative removal options to expedite removal—including removal by Parking Division staff or utilizing a third-party contractor. The Administration may return to City Council for additional resources to facilitate expedited removal. Alternatively, Council may identify expedited removal as a priority for resources in the FY 24 budget process.

5. How long it would take for the City to devise a comprehensive on-street usage plan in Over the Rhine north of Liberty Street, Pendleton, and the West End. This plan would be akin to Southern Over the Rhine's SPP plan, which has all curb space allocated appropriately as metered parking, residential parking, etc.

The OTR North parking study timing and cost does not include Pendleton (which already has an RPP) or the West End, as a portion of the West End is already covered by an RPP. DCED requested Walker Consultants submit a proposal based on the following scope of services: Study Objectives: 1) To document existing on-street parking space inventory, usage, and restrictions and recommend changes that could improve parking space availability in OTR North. 2) To identify and document options for improving usage of off-street parking assets and adding to the off-street parking space inventory. The cost for the study will be approximately \$126,000 inclusive of reimbursables.

Alternatively, the Cincinnati Center City Development Corporation (3CDC) has offered to undertake a more limited inventory of existing space to submit to the Administration for evaluation reclassification of spaces between metered, residential, and restricted spaces. 3CDC and the Administration have begun coordinating this effort with existing City resources (like a recent roadway signage inventory) to begin the inventory process. The Administration recommends this lower-cost option.

The Administration estimates that the initial curb inventory will be completed by mid-April. Once the curb inventory is completed, the Administration will draft a proposed Special Permit Parking Area (SPPA) for OTR-North that would create residential spaces. The Administration will seek public input on the proposed designation prior to proposing the SPPA for Council consideration. To leave ample time for public feedback and revisions, the Administration does not expect to submit SPPA legislation prior to October of 2023. As requested in Motion Item # 202300645, engagement activities for the SPPA will include reaching out to the Corporation for Findlay Market and seeking input from their vendors.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

The Administration recommends the following actions:

1. The Administration will review staffing levels of the Parking Division to determine if additional personnel is appropriate for FY 24 to accommodate more directed enforcement, additional routes and concentration in areas experiencing peak hour demand and safety issues.
2. The Administration recommends conducting a feasibility analysis to determine if a tiered increase rate structure should replace the current overtime parking enforcement process for increasing on-street parking turnover.
3. The Administration will review options for completing the removal of obsolete parking meter poles and may make budget recommendations as early as FY24 if additional resources are required.
4. The Administration recommends proceeding with 3CDC to undertake a limited curb inventory for the purpose of evaluating a special residential permit parking area for north Over-The-Rhine.

Attachment: I. Citation data table

Copies: Markiea L. Carter, Director, DCED
John S. Brazina, Director, DOTE

February 23, 2023

To: Mayor and Members of City Council

From: Sheryl M.M. Long, City Manager

202300660

Subject: Emergency Ordinance: Modifying Chapter 306, "General Compensation Provisions," of the Cincinnati Municipal Code

Attached is an Emergency Ordinance captioned:

MODIFYING Chapter 306, "General Compensation Provisions," of the Cincinnati Municipal Code by **AMENDING** Section 306-7, "Special Salary Provisions," Section 306-11, "Increases and Reclassifications," and Section 306-13, "Transfers and Promotions," to conform the Cincinnati Municipal Code to evolving trends in the labor market.

The Administration recommends passage of this Emergency Ordinance.

cc: Edward G. Ramsey, Human Resources Director

EMERGENCY

LES

2023

MODIFYING Chapter 306, “General Compensation Provisions,” of the Cincinnati Municipal Code by AMENDING Section 306-7, “Special Salary Provisions,” Section 306-11, “Increases and Reclassifications,” and Section 306-13, “Transfers and Promotions,” to conform the Cincinnati Municipal Code to evolving trends in the labor market.

WHEREAS, the City of Cincinnati Human Resources Department is recommending a modification to the current base compensation policy for employees ordained in Chapter 306 of the Cincinnati Municipal Code, which has not been updated since August 1, 1979; and

WHEREAS, the labor market, technology, collective bargaining, employment standards, and regulations pertaining to civic duty and public employment have changed significantly in the last fifty years, and the sections of the Cincinnati Municipal Code regarding base compensation for employees have become obsolete; and

WHEREAS, flexibility to modify employment compensation policies is needed to recruit and retain talented employees; now, therefore,

BE IT ORDAINED by the Council of the City of Cincinnati, State of Ohio:

Section 1. That Sections 306-7, “Special Salary Provisions,” 306-11, “Increases and Reclassifications,” and 306-13, “Transfers and Promotions,” of the Cincinnati Municipal Code are hereby amended as follows:

Sec. 306-7. Special Salary Provisions.

- (a) Where the salary heretofore paid an employee is in excess of the maximum rate herein provided, such salary shall continue in effect as long as such employee continues to serve the city in the same capacity and to render satisfactory service.
- (b) Officers and employees entering the service of the city generally shall begin at the minimum rate for the classification to which they are being appointed, except as provided in policies or rules adopted pursuant to subsection (c). ~~except in the case of such classes of employees for which no specific steps are set forth, in which case the compensation shall be fixed at such rate between the minimum and maximum prescribed, as may be determined by the appointing authority; provided, that in exceptional cases, the appointing authority is hereby empowered, subject to the approval of the civil service commission, to employ persons at rates higher than the~~

~~(c) minimum rate prescribed if, in the judgment of the appointing authority, it is impossible to obtain properly qualified persons at the minimum rate. Where both hourly and annual rates are prescribed in the compensation schedule for a class, the appointing authority shall determine which rate shall prevail.~~

~~(d) The personnel officer shall prepare policies or rules approved by the city manager pertaining to salaries for new employees, including rules that authorize a starting salary at rates higher than the minimum rate prescribed and salary adjustments for existing employees due to promotion or other employment actions.~~

Sec. 306-11. Salary Increases and Reclassifications.

(a) Increases. Any officer or employee may advance successively to the higher rates of compensation only after demonstrating that such person has attained and maintained prescribed standards of efficiency and is deserving of an increase because of meritorious service as determined by the expectations of the appropriate appointing authority based on completed performance evaluations that comply with human resources policies and procedures. All increases shall be made upon recommendation of the appointing authority, but such recommendations shall be made in accordance with policies or rules and regulations prepared by the personnel officer and approved by the city manager setting forth criteria to be met in order to qualify for an advancement to a higher rate of pay in the compensation schedule.

The personnel officer shall review every proposed compensation advancement for (1) employees appointed by the city manager and (2) employees appointed by the various independent boards and commissions of the city, and shall approve all recommendations for compensation increases that are in conformance with the criteria set forth in the rules and regulations. No increase in compensation shall be granted without such approval.

All salary adjustments shall be effective at the beginning of a pay period.

~~(b) For the sworn personnel in the police division increases in compensation shall become effective as follows: If the first of January, April, July and/or October falls within the first seven days of a pay period the effective date of step up shall be the beginning of the pay period. If the first of the above mentioned months falls within the second seven days of a pay period the effective date of step up shall be the beginning of the following pay period. The beginning of a pay period shall be defined as beginning on a Sunday.~~

~~For the sworn personnel in the fire division and for all non-uniformed employees increases in compensation shall become effective on the first day of the first pay period following the first day of the month following the employee's anniversary date marking the date of his employment or most recent promotion.~~

~~(eb) Penalty for Low Efficiency. Any employee who has two successive low service ratings shall automatically be referred by the department or division head to the~~

appointing authority for appropriate action under the existing laws and policies or rules prepared by the personnel officer and approved by the city manager.

~~(d) Reclassification. When, because of physical or other infirmities, an employee is unable to render efficient service in his or her classification but is qualified for service in another classification, the employee may, upon recommendation of the appointing authority and with the approval of the civil service commission, be transferred to such other classification at the rate of compensation in such classification next lower than the previous rate of compensation received by the employee.~~

Sec. 306-13. Salary adjustment due to Reclassifications, Demotions, Transfers, and Promotions.

~~When an employee is transferred to a different classification in the interests of the service, compensation shall be fixed at the same rate as in the former classification, if the new classification contains such a rate; otherwise, at the rate in the new classification next higher than the previous compensation received by the employee.~~

~~(a) Reclassification and Transfer. When the work of an employee is better suited to a different classification than the employee's current classification, the employee may be reclassified in accordance with applicable civil service rules or policy. If necessary under the polices or rules prepared by the personnel officer and approved by the city manager, such reclassification also will require the recommendation of the appointing authority and the approval of the civil service commission. The employee's compensation in the new classification shall be fixed at the same rate as in the employee's former classification if the new classification contains such a rate. If the new classification does not contain such a rate, the employee's compensation shall be fixed at the rate in the new classification next higher than the previous compensation received by the employee.~~

~~(b) Demotion. When an employee is placed into a classification with a lower salary schedule due to voluntary or involuntary demotion, the employee's compensation will be set at the next-lower step or rate of compensation in the new classification.~~

~~(c) Promotion. When an employee is promoted from one classification to a higher classification, the employee's compensation shall be fixed according to the policies or rules prepared by the personnel officer and approved by the city manager. at the rate in the new classification next higher than the compensation rate previously received by the employee.~~

~~Whenever, owing to the military service provisions of Section 143.22 of the Ohio Revised Code, it becomes necessary to transfer a promoted employee or other employee to a lower classification, the compensation after transfer shall be, in the case of the promoted employee, at the rate received prior to the promotion, if there is such rate in the lower classification, otherwise at the next higher rate, and, in the case of any other employee, at the beginning rate in the lower classification, with the proviso, in either case, that if, during the period of service in the higher classification, the employee, in the opinion of the~~

~~appointing authority, has demonstrated that such employee could have advanced in his or her compensation rate in the lower class, and such fact is certified by the appointing authority, the employee shall be paid at the rate to which the employee could have advanced.~~

(d) For the purposes of this section, the civil service ~~commission~~ secretary shall determine whether the change from one class to another is a reclassification, demotion, promotion, or a transfer based on the civil service commission rules. If the civil service commission rules do not specify whether a particular change in class is a reclassification, demotion, promotion, or transfer, the civil service commission shall make that determination.

Section 2. That existing Section 306-7 “Special Salary Provisions,” Section 306-11 “Increases and Reclassifications,” and Section 306-13, “Transfers and Promotions,” of the Cincinnati Municipal Code are hereby repealed.

Section 3. That this ordinance shall be an emergency measure necessary for the preservation of the public peace, health, safety, and general welfare and shall, subject to the terms of Article II, Section 6 of the Charter, be effective immediately. The reason for the emergency is the immediate need to adjust the compensation provisions of the Cincinnati Municipal Code to ensure competitive recruitment and retention of City employees.

Passed: _____, 2023

Aftab Pureval, Mayor

Attest: _____
Clerk