

March 1, 2023

202300704

To: Mayor and Members of City Council  
From: Sheryl M.M. Long, City Manager  
Subject: **COUNCIL REPORT – Parking Enforcement, Meters & Residential Permits**

---

**REFERENCE DOCUMENT #202202004 and #202300645**

The City Council referred Item # 202202004, at its session on November 2, 2022, and Item #202300645, at its session on February 15, 2023, for review and report:

**MOTION #202202004**

***Parking Enforcement, Meters & Residential Permits***

WE MOVE that, the Administration report back to council in ninety (90) days with:

- The number of parking tickets issued per year for the past five years by neighborhood [BALANCE OF MOTION ON FILE]

**MOTION #202300645**

***Parking Enforcement, Meters & Residential Permits***

WE MOVE for the Administration to engage with business owners who operate in the area around Green and Pleasant Street in Over-The-Rhine [BALANCE OF MOTION ON FILE]

## ANALYSIS OF REQUESTED INFORMATION

1. The number of parking tickets issued per year for the past five years by neighborhood

See attached citation data table.

2. What resources, if any, would be needed to ensure parking rules and regulations are enforced across the city—particularly in high volume areas during peak times like the urban basin and neighborhood business districts during events, evenings, and weekends

Management of the parking system consists of staffing for enforcement, collections, and maintenance for all parking system assets. The Department of Community & Economic Development's Parking Division (Parking Division) has sufficient staffing for all of these functions during all operating hours of the parking system. Parking enforcement is comprised of a balanced mix of routes which are generally designed around metered parking and restricted zones. These routes are then supplemented by complaint-based enforcement in various neighborhoods. Furthermore, the Parking Division works closely with Cincinnati Police Department (CPD) to staff events and special assignments. With our existing resources, the Parking Division believes that we are sufficiently enforcing within these areas. However, adding parking enforcement officers would allow for more directed enforcement, additional routes, and concentration in areas experiencing peak hour demand and safety issues. An increase in enforcement personnel would require an increase to the Parking Division staffing level and budget. The below table outlines the outcomes the costs in salary/fringe benefits and associated enforcement hours and revenue that would result. Note that these figures do not assume turnover in the positions and a full year of activity.

Parking Enforcement Officer (PEO)	Additional enforcement hours	Costs (salary, benefits)	Citation revenue	Net
4	5280	\$260,000	\$540,000	\$280,000

3. Any recommendations on how to better manage existing parking assets like meters and designated residential spaces to ensure turnover and on-street parking availability

Management of parking assets involves both up to date equipment and sufficient staffing for enforcement. One budget scenario for increasing enforcement within the on-street parking system was provided above. Related to equipment, the Parking Division is moving to reduce the City's reliance on single space meters which have a higher cost per space to maintain than efficiently deployed multi-space kiosks and mobile payment options. This is being accomplished by expanding the purchase and

use of multi-space meter zones (kiosks), expanding the use of the City’s “mobile only” payment zones, and creating strategies to drive adoption of mobile payment options for metered parking, specifically by adding another mobile payment provider to the City’s current platform. Mobile only payment zones are the most efficient to manage as they require little physical alteration to the existing infrastructure to add or remove paid parking alternatives. The Administration can promote efficient management through parking equipment in two specific ways. First, when stakeholders request the addition of paid parking to an area where parking is presently unrestricted, the Parking Division can implement paid parking in mobile payment only zones rather than meters. Second, the Parking Division can continue replacing existing meters with multi-space kiosks and/or mobile payment zones.

Further, the Parking Division recently took over the administrative responsibility of managing the Residential Parking Permit program (RPPP) from the Department of Transportation and Engineering (DOTe). Upon taking over administration of the RPPP, the Parking Division has implemented a digital permitting system. The new system replaces the former “hang tag” system with a digital, user-managed system. The system allows for quick access to visitor permits, payments, and customer service support. The Parking Division continues to look for ways to improve the customer experience of existing residential zones through the digital system.

Finally, Parking Division is also reviewing options for creating better incentives to generate on-street parking turnover for businesses. Currently, customers cannot occupy a paid parking space for more than the marked time period, which is commonly two hours. If they exceed the marked time period, they can receive a ticket for an overtime parking violation. In many other cities, the overtime parking violation process is being replaced by tiered increase rate structure programs. The initial findings in some markets are showing positive results for both creating the desired turnover to support businesses and maximizing potential on-street parking revenue. Utilizing tiered rates can increase turnover as an alternative to increased enforcement of existing hour limitations.

4. What resources would be needed to remove defunct parking meter posts (as shown in Exhibit A of the Motion) and, if appropriate, install parking stalls in their place?

A top priority for the Parking Division in FY2024 is the removal of obsolete parking meter poles. Within the Administration, Parking Division is working with DOTe (work order creation) to identify all the defunct parking meter posts and schedule removal through the Department of Public Services (DPS). Currently there are 700-800 poles estimated in need of removal. This number will increase by 500-600 as we implement the expanded multi-space meter zones and mobile only payment pilot zones throughout the City.

Removal of defunct parking meter polls will not begin until early FY24, due to current DPS projects (including mobile parking sign upgrades) and preparation for snow operations. An estimate of completion of removal of all defunct poles is difficult due to competing DPS capacity demands and increasing number of poles needing removal; however, Parking Division estimates that the majority of currently defunct poles can be removed by the end of CY2023.

Additionally, the Parking Division is assessing alternative removal options to expedite removal—including removal by Parking Division staff or utilizing a third-party contractor. The Administration may return to City Council for additional resources to facilitate expedited removal. Alternatively, Council may identify expedited removal as a priority for resources in the FY 24 budget process.

5. How long it would take for the City to devise a comprehensive on-street usage plan in Over the Rhine north of Liberty Street, Pendleton, and the West End. This plan would be akin to Southern Over the Rhine's SPP plan, which has all curb space allocated appropriately as metered parking, residential parking, etc.

The OTR North parking study timing and cost does not include Pendleton (which already has an RPP) or the West End, as a portion of the West End is already covered by an RPP. DCED requested Walker Consultants submit a proposal based on the following scope of services: Study Objectives: 1) To document existing on-street parking space inventory, usage, and restrictions and recommend changes that could improve parking space availability in OTR North. 2) To identify and document options for improving usage of off-street parking assets and adding to the off-street parking space inventory. The cost for the study will be approximately \$126,000 inclusive of reimbursables.

Alternatively, the Cincinnati Center City Development Corporation (3CDC) has offered to undertake a more limited inventory of existing space to submit to the Administration for evaluation reclassification of spaces between metered, residential, and restricted spaces. 3CDC and the Administration have begun coordinating this effort with existing City resources (like a recent roadway signage inventory) to begin the inventory process. The Administration recommends this lower-cost option.

The Administration estimates that the initial curb inventory will be completed by mid-April. Once the curb inventory is completed, the Administration will draft a proposed Special Permit Parking Area (SPPA) for OTR-North that would create residential spaces. The Administration will seek public input on the proposed designation prior to proposing the SPPA for Council consideration. To leave ample time for public feedback and revisions, the Administration does not expect to submit SPPA legislation prior to October of 2023. As requested in Motion Item # 202300645, engagement activities for the SPPA will include reaching out to the Corporation for Findlay Market and seeking input from their vendors.

## SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

The Administration recommends the following actions:

1. The Administration will review staffing levels of the Parking Division to determine if additional personnel is appropriate for FY 24 to accommodate more directed enforcement, additional routes and concentration in areas experiencing peak hour demand and safety issues.
2. The Administration recommends conducting a feasibility analysis to determine if a tiered increase rate structure should replace the current overtime parking enforcement process for increasing on-street parking turnover.
3. The Administration will review options for completing the removal of obsolete parking meter poles and may make budget recommendations as early as FY24 if additional resources are required.
4. The Administration recommends proceeding with 3CDC to undertake a limited curb inventory for the purpose of evaluating a special residential permit parking area for north Over-The-Rhine.

Attachment: I. Citation data table

Copies: Markiea L. Carter, Director, DCED  
John S. Brazina, Director, DOTE