



City of Cincinnati

801 Plum Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Agenda - Final

Public Safety & Governance

Councilmember Scotty Johnson, Chair
Vice Mayor Jan-Michele Kearney, Vice Chair
Councilmember Mark Jeffreys
Councilmember Anna Albi

Tuesday, February 4, 2025

9:30 AM

Council Chambers, Room 300

AGENDA

- [202500166](#) **MOTION**, submitted by Vice Mayor Kearney, **WE MOVE** that the Administration provide a report within sixty (60) days including but not limited to information on what resources and mechanisms are in place for the public to report and address hate crimes, the existence of a hate crimes hotline, availability to the public of collected data, follow-up procedures, and policy for reporting data on hate crimes to City Council. (STATEMENT ATTACHED)

Sponsors: Kearney

Attachments: [Motion](#)
- [202500080](#) **REPORT**, dated 1/23/2025, submitted Sheryl M. M. Long, City Manager, regarding the Motion to Promote Health and Wellness of Cincinnati Firefighters. (Reference Document # 202402178)

Sponsors: City Manager

Attachments: [Transmittal](#)

ADJOURNMENT



2025 00166

January 27, 2025

MOTION

What procedures are in place for reporting and addressing hate crimes?

WE MOVE that the administration provide a report within sixty (60) days including but not limited to information on what resources and mechanisms are in place for the public to report and address hate crimes, the existence of a hate crimes hotline, availability to the public of collected data, follow-up procedures, and policy for reporting data on hate crimes to City Council.


Vice Mayor Jan-Michele L. Kearney

STATEMENT

Section 12.417 of Cincinnati's Municipal Code, entitled, "Hate Crimes: Response to Racial, Religious, Ethnic/National Origin, or Sexual Orientation Bias Incidents" (attached), sets forth policy to address hate crimes. This section also references additional sections of our Municipal Code that address hate crimes. This Motion seeks a report on reviewing our procedures for implementation of Cincinnati's hate crime laws, to ensure that we are being effective, and to identify areas of opportunity to strengthen our hate crimes policy and procedures.

12.417 HATE CRIMES: RESPONSE TO RACIAL, RELIGIOUS, ETHNIC/NATIONAL ORIGIN, OR SEXUAL ORIENTATION BIAS INCIDENTS

References:

Procedure 12.160 - Rumors/Potential Civil Disturbances
 Procedure 12.170 - Civil Disturbance Operation Procedure
 Procedure 12.400 - Offense Reporting, Miscellaneous Reporting
 Procedure 18.120 - Release of Information and Public Records
 Cincinnati Municipal Code (CMC) 908-3 Criminal Intimidation
 Public Law 101-275: Hate Crime Statistics Act
 Ohio Revised Code (ORC) 2927.12 (Ethnic Intimidation)
 Ohio Revised Code (ORC) 2929.12 (B)(8)(Seriousness and recidivism factors)

Purpose:

To accomplish our Mission and demonstrate the commitment we have in valuing human life and dignity by taking a proactive role in promoting peace and harmony within the community and ensuring that the rights of all individuals are protected.

To comply with Public Law 101-275: Hate Crime Statistics Act requirements, the Ohio Revised Code, and State Sentencing guidelines.

To comply with the FBI's National Incident Based Reporting System's (NIBRS) requirements for submitting incident-based crime reporting data.

Definition:

A **Hate Crime** is a committed, threatened, or attempted criminal act by any person(s) against a person or property of another individual or group that may in any way constitute an expression of racial, religious, ethnic/national origin, sexual orientation, or other forms of bias.

Motivated by prejudices, hate crimes may include but are not limited to: threatening communications, physical assaults, vandalism, cross burnings, destruction of religious symbols, and firebombing.

The Ohio Revised Code identifies and defines the following **protected classes** under the Ethnic Intimidation statute: a person or group of persons based upon their race, color, religion, or national origin.

The Cincinnati Municipal Code identifies and defines the following **protected classes** under the Criminal Intimidation section: a person or group of persons based upon the actual or perceived race, color, religion, national origin, gender, physical or mental disability, sexual orientation or age (60 and above).

Sexual orientation – means an individual's actual or perceived heterosexuality, homosexuality, bisexuality or transgender status, by orientation or practice.

Transgender – means the condition or state wherein a person manifests gender characteristics, behavior and/or self-identification typical of or commonly associated with persons of another gender, and which may be characterized by assumption of the clothes, hairstyles, cosmetic usage or other appearance qualities commonly associated with another gender and/or by the surgical or medical modification of primary sexual organs in order to assume the gender role of another sex.

Information:

Single criminal acts such as aggravated menacing, menacing, criminal damaging, criminal mischief, or telecommunications harassment may initially appear as less serious when viewed in the larger context of all crime. However, what might begin as a minor offense may escalate into a more serious crime, particularly if the crime was motivated by bias. Such criminal acts may generate fear and concern among victims and the broader public, and have the potential to escalate, possibly causing counter-violence. Therefore, if an incident appears to be one of racial, religious, ethnic/national origin, sexual orientation, or other forms of bias, it should be investigated as such.

Verification can be made during the investigation. Reports should be reviewed for *patterns* of incidents occurring at either the same location or directed at a particular individual or group. The motivation behind the act determines whether an incident is bias related. Listed below are several reminders to consider in determining if probable cause exists to believe that an incident was motivated entirely or in part by animosity toward the victim because of his/her race, religion, ethnic/national origin or sexual orientation:

- Were words, symbols, or acts which are or may be offensive to an identifiable group used by the perpetrator or are they present as evidence?
- Are the victim and the suspected perpetrator members of different racial, religious or ethnic groups?
- Does a meaningful portion of the community perceive and respond to the situation as a bias-related incident?

- Is there an ongoing neighborhood problem that may have initiated or contributed to the act (e.g., could the act be retribution or some conflict between neighbors or with area juveniles)?
- Does the perpetrator have a true understanding of the impact of the crime/incident on the victim or other group members? Are the perpetrators juveniles?
- Does the crime/incident indicate possible involvement by an organized hate group?

Policy:

All Hate Crimes will be treated seriously and the investigations of these crimes will be given priority. The proper investigation of racial, religious, ethnic/national origin, sexual orientation, or other bias crime incidents, is the responsibility of all Cincinnati Police officers. The Department will use every necessary resource to rapidly and decisively identify the perpetrators, arrest them and bring them before the court.

The actions taken by the Police Department in dealing with incidents of racial, religious, ethnic/national origin, sexual orientation, or other acts of bias, are visible signs of its concern and commitment to the community. Special emphasis will be placed on victim assistance and community cooperation in order to reduce victim/community trauma or fear.

Officers must demonstrate sensitivity toward the feelings, needs and concerns that may be present in the community as a result of incidents of this nature.

Procedure:

- A. When an on-scene officer makes a determination that an incident is a criminal act of racial, religious, ethnic/national origin, sexual orientation, or other form of bias, the officer will:
1. Render necessary assistance to the victim(s) and if necessary request the fire department in the case of fire or injury.
 2. Conduct a preliminary investigation.
 3. Identify and arrest the perpetrator(s) if possible.
 - a. Officer shall use the appropriate ORC charge, unless a class is encountered that is only protected under CMC.
 4. Protect and preserve the crime scene and evidence.
 5. Notify a supervisor.

6. Prepare a detailed offense report.
 7. Fax a copy of the offense report(s) to the Office of Neighborhood Policing, Intelligence Unit, Public Information Office (PIO), and the Cincinnati Human Relations Commission (CHRC).
- B. Supervisor will:
1. If necessary, respond immediately.
 2. Determine the seriousness of the incident and make appropriate notifications. For serious incidents (serious physical harm or a significant event) the supervisor shall:
 - a. Notify the Officer in Charge (OIC).
 3. Arrange for immediate increase of patrols throughout the affected area. If necessary, have "standby" units from other districts respond to the scene.
 4. Contact the victim(s) as soon as possible and assure them that the investigation will be actively pursued.
 5. Complete an After Action Report detailing events and actions by Department.
 6. Ensure a copy of the offense report(s) is faxed to the Office of Neighborhood Policing, the Intelligence Unit, PIO, and CHRC.
 - a. CHRC will be the liaison with all victim/advocacy/service groups.
- C. Shift OIC
1. After being notified by an on scene supervisor of a serious Hate Crime incident (serious physical harm or a significant event), the shift will notify the following:
 - a. District OIC
 - b. Night Inspector (if applicable)
 - c. Duty Officer
 - d. District Commander

- e. Intelligence Unit
 - f. Public Information Office (PIO)
 - g. Federal Bureau of Investigations (FBI)
 - h. Community Liaison Commander
2. The Emergency Communications Center (ECC) will provide assistance to the OIC when requested.
- D. Cincinnati Human Relations Commission (CHRC)
1. CHRC will act as an expert liaison between the community leaders and outside agencies willing to respond to provide needed service. Upon request CHRC shall:
- a. Respond to the scene.
 - b. The OIC will brief the CHRC representative about the crimes that have occurred, the steps taken by police and the current tension level within the targeted neighborhood or other areas of the city.
 - c. As outlined in the CHRC internal procedure, the Executive Director of the CHRC will coordinate with the CHRC field representatives, who will respond as requested and contact the incident OIC.
 - d. The ranking command officer will determine what actions the CHRC representative may take
 - e. The OIC will evaluate and determine the effectiveness of the actions of the CHRC field representatives in calming the situation.
 - 1) If the ranking command officer believes CHRC field representatives are no longer effective, he will notify them to cease their activity and withdraw.
 - 2) The ranking command officer should base this determination on such criteria as some overt action on the part of the crowd, an increase in the size of the crowd, etc.

- f. The incident OIC will request CHRC to submit a report of their observations and assessment of the incident to the Intelligence Unit Commander.

E. Media

1. Officers will refer the media to the ranking on-scene supervisor.
 - a. The OIC will ensure PIO is notified and informed of the information released and progress of the investigation.
2. After a thorough field investigation, PIO will provide factual information to the media.
3. PIO will respond to the scene of all serious Hate Crime incident(s) and coordinate the release of information to the media.

F. Collection of Data and Reporting

1. All Hate Crime Offenses are identified through the National Incident Based Reporting System.
2. The Office of Neighborhood Policing shall provide updated Hate Crime information and statistics to community councils and groups.
 - a. Police Intelligence Unit shall analyze Hate Crime trends and provide quarterly reports to the Police Chief.

CAL → Healthy Neighborhoods
LMK

E. Media

- 1. Officers will refer the media to the ranking on-scene supervisor.
- 2. The OIC will ensure PIO is notified and informed of the information released and progress of the investigation.
- 3. After a thorough field investigation, PIO will provide factual information to the media.
- 4. PIO will respond to the scene of all serious Hate Crime incident(s) and coordinate the release of information to the media.

F. Collection of Data and Reporting

- 1. All Hate Crime Offenses are identified through the National Incident Based Reporting System.
- 2. The Office of Neighborhood Policing shall provide updated Hate Crime information and statistics to community councils and groups.
- 3. Police Intelligence Unit shall analyze Hate Crime trends and provide quarterly reports to the Police Chief.

January 23, 2025

To: Mayor and Members of City Council 202500080
From: Sheryl M.M. Long, City Manager *SM*
Subject: Report on Motion to Promote Health and Wellness of Cincinnati Firefighters

Reference Document #202402178

On October 10, 2024, the Public Safety and Governance Committee referred the following for a report:

MOTION, dated October 10, 2024, submitted by Vice Mayor Jan-Michele Lemon Kearney and Councilmember Scotty Johnson, **WE MOVE** that the administration prepare a report by the end of this calendar year on the cost and feasibility, as well as recommendations for implementation of the following measures to enhance the health and wellness of Cincinnati firefighters with involvement from the Cincinnati Firefighters Union Local 48 throughout the process:

1. Annual Comprehensive Firefighter Occupational Health Exams, to include a Multi-Cancer Early Detection (MCED) test, to proactively screen for cancer and other occupational health risks.
2. Upgrade Workout Equipment in all 26 firehouses to ensure firefighters have access to modern, functional fitness tools that support their physical conditioning and job performance.
3. Funding for Certification for 15 Firefighters as Health and Wellness Coaches, enabling them to provide expert guidance on nutrition, physical exercise, and wellness practices, and to support their peers in maintaining optimal health.

These initiatives aim to promote long-term health, early disease diagnosis, and wellness support for our firefighting workforce.

The following report outlines the estimated cost and feasibility of implementing annual comprehensive firefighter occupational health exams, to include an MCED test. Specifically, the report details programs of other municipalities across the United States, outlines the standards of the National Fire Protection Association (NFPA), and makes recommendations based on industry standards, NFPA 1582 requirements, and the Ohio Revised Code.

Additionally, this report outlines the current inventory of workout equipment across all 26 firehouses and the cost and feasibility of replacing and/or upgrading the equipment. Finally, this report lays out the cost and feasibility of certifying 15 Firefighters as Health and Wellness Programs and makes recommendations on the implementation of the proposed measures.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

It is recommended that:

- The City move forward with implementation of annual comprehensive occupational health exams, to include comprehensive cancer screening, which may include multi-cancer early detection testing and/or additional screening methods. The costs of this examination should be included in the Cincinnati Fire Department's (hereafter "CFD") FY2026 budget.
- That CFD conduct a comprehensive evaluation of their existing fitness equipment including equipment age, appearance, maintenance, and user experience to allow the City Administration to better determine the amount of equipment that needs replacement and assist with replacement prioritization.
- That CFD work with the City's Procurement office to release a Request for Information (RFI) to obtain additional information regarding various Health and Wellness Certification programs. This will give CFD and the Cincinnati Firefighters Union Local 48 ("Union") a more comprehensive overview of the options, cost, and benefits of each certification program for their consideration.

ANNUAL COMPREHENSIVE FIREFIGHTER OCCUPATIONAL HEALTH EXAMS, TO INCLUDE A MULTI-CANCER EARLY DETECTION TEST

In order to obtain a better understanding of the surrounding municipalities' policies on Occupational Exams for Fire Department Personnel, the following questions were posed to various cities:

- Does the department conduct annual or semi-annual medical and fitness evaluations and cancer screenings in accordance with the standards of NFPA 1582?
- Which of the below items is covered under that examination?
 - General Physical exam?
 - Blood tests?
 - Urinalysis?
 - Vision test?
 - Hearing screening?
 - Pulmonary function test (Spirometry)?
 - EKG?
 - Chest X-ray?
 - Comprehensive Cancer screening?
 - Heavy metal screening?
 - Other? (Please specify)
- Is the evaluation mandatory or voluntary?
- Is the evaluation covered under a collective bargaining agreement?
- Does the city receive a copy of the results and/or a certification that an individual is "fit for duty?"
- Is the full cost covered by the city?

Inquiries were sent out to around 20 municipalities, with a response rate of approximately 65%.¹ Responses are summarized in the table below.

Municipality	Annual Evaluation?	What is covered?	Mandatory?	Covered in a Collective Bargaining Agreement?	Does the City receive the results?	Cost fully covered by the city?
Columbus, Ohio	Yes. The city of Columbus Physical Health and Fitness program is not in strict compliance with NFPA 1582 but does include some of its components .	General Physical exam, Blood tests, Urinalysis, Vision test, Hearing Screening, Pulmonary function test, EKG, Chest X-Ray, Heavy Metal Screening.	Yes	Yes, Article 38 of the CBA	Human Resources within the Division of Fire receives fitness testing results for incentive purposes, a generic overview (disposition) of any restrictions, and/or other follow up information on a case-by-case basis due to extenuating circumstances. Protected medical information does not typically get sent to HR and every effort is made to minimize the amount shared. Medical results, including any lab results, are	Yes. Please note the City of Columbus does not pay for any necessary follow-up

¹ No response was received from the following municipalities: Cleveland, Akron, Canton, Detroit, Charlotte, Phoenix

Municipality	Annual Evaluation?	What is covered?	Mandatory?	Covered in a Collective Bargaining Agreement?	Does the City receive the results?	Cost fully covered by the city?
					provided directly to the firefighter and are rarely provided to the Division of Fire.	
Dayton, Ohio	Conducts physicals for 1/3 of its members annually. We encourage all members to get a physical at their doctor (covered by insurance) or the City of Dayton of Dayton-operated employee health center (DOC) if they do not fall into the 1/3 eligible for the current year.	Head-to-toe physical exam, treadmill (sub max HR), Resting 12 lead EKG, Muscular Strength, Vision/Hearing testing, Flexibility testing, Urinalysis, Waist/Hip ratio, Pulmonary Function test, Body Fat (BIA)	Unknown	Originated in an MOU	The city does not receive the results for any physicals or if they are "fit for duty."	Yes (HR and the Fire Department share the cost)
Indianapolis, Indiana	Yes, annual medical and fitness physical exams.	General physical exam, blood tests, urinalysis, vision test, hearing	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Municipal ity	Annual Evaluatio n?	What is covered?	Mandator y?	Covered in a Collective Bargainin g Agreemen t?	Does the City receive the results?	Cost fully covered by the city?
		screening, pulmonary function test, EKG. The wellness facility will cover the cost of low-dose chest x-ray for each firefighter that requests to be referred for the x-ray. Additionally, body fat testing, flexibility and strength testing, exercise prescriptions and training.				
Louisville, Kentucky	The department , through our Occupation al Health provider, conducts a mandatory annual medical assessment for all members except non- hazardous duty staff.	Pulmonary function test, HFIT (fecal), Written medical opinion (single or multi- exposure), Written medical opinion for respirator use, EKG, Audio, Vision, Medical exam report, Lab report (comprehensive metabolic panel), Lab report (CBC), Urinalysis,	Yes	Yes	Once the exam is reviewed by the department surgeon, a “fit for duty” form is sent to leadership for their records.	Yes

Municipal city	Annual Evaluation?	What is covered?	Mandatory?	Covered in a Collective Bargaining Agreement?	Does the City receive the results?	Cost fully covered by the city?
		Lipid panel, PSA, Chest X-Ray, FF exam.				
Lexington, Kentucky	Yes, conducted annually	Follow the recommendations of NFPA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Toledo, Ohio	The department provides a biannual physical for our specialty teams.	General physical exam, blood tests, urinalysis, vision test, hearing screening, pulmonary function test, EKG, Chest X-ray, comprehensive cancer screening, heavy metal screening.	Mandatory as long as the member is part of a specialty team.	Unknown	The results are shared with the department that the member is “fit for duty”, as the cost for the biannual screening is covered by the City.	Yes
Nashville, Tennessee	Yes, exams are scheduled periodically for fitness evaluations as directed under metro rules. These evaluations are typically performed annually.	General physical exam, blood tests, urinalysis, vision test, hearing screening, pulmonary function test, EKG, Heavy Metal Screening (HazMat team). Annual chest x-rays are not performed. The medical exam is expected to alert us to	Yes	No. It is covered under Metro’s Civil Service provisions.	The Department is notified if the evaluation indicates the employee is not fit for duty.	Yes

Municipality	Annual Evaluation?	What is covered?	Mandatory?	Covered in a Collective Bargaining Agreement?	Does the City receive the results?	Cost fully covered by the city?
		abnormalities that max lead to a DX of cancer in members.				
Memphis, Tennessee	Annual medicals and cancer screenings can be done through LifeSign/West Clinic.	General physical exam, blood tests, urinalysis, hearing screening, pulmonary function test, EKG, Chest X-ray, comprehensive cancer screening.	Voluntary	No	No	It is covered by medical insurance.
St. Louis, Missouri	The St. Louis Fire Department has both an annual physical and a 5-year Heart and Lung physical.	5-year Heart/Lung Physical: General physical Exam w/BP, Chest X-Ray report, EKG results and copy of tracing, Blood study: Chemistry, CBC, CMP, SMA 24, PSA; Urinalysis, Basic Pulmonary Function Study, DLCO (if normalities are present), 100 Percent skin exam, Breast	Both tests are voluntary. The annual physical is incentivized while the 5-year heart and lung is recorded by the Pension.	Unknown	The Pension office receives a full copy of the 5-year heart and lung tests conducted. The department receives documentation that the annual tests were completed, no results are submitted. The medical office may be notified of any significant finding that may render an employee unfit	Both exams are fully covered by the city for members who have the City's health insurance coverage and have the testing done at one of the partnering medical facilities. If the employee chooses to have testing done with their PCP they will be responsible for the co-pay.

Municipality	Annual Evaluation?	What is covered?	Mandatory?	Covered in a Collective Bargaining Agreement?	Does the City receive the results?	Cost fully covered by the city?
		<p>exam or mammogram, Occult Blood Screen or colonoscopy, Pelvic Exam with PAP, HIV Test, Hepatitis A antibody, IgG, test, Hepatitis B surface antibody test, Hepatitis C antibody test</p> <p>Annual Physical: General Physical Exam w/ BP, HIV test, Hepatitis A antibody, IgG test, Hepatitis B surface antibody test, Hepatitis C antibody test</p>			depending on where the testing takes place.	
Minneapolis, Minnesota	We do an annual "Health Fair" that covers the four basic OSHA mandated exams (Hearing, Respiratory	All Employees: General physical exam , Hearing screening, Pulmonary function test (spirometry)/resping blood pressure, Heavy Metal	Yes, with the exception of the cancer screening which is voluntary.	Yes	The City does receive the results of the Pulmonary Function Exam ("Pass," "Respirator Use with Restrictions," or "Not Approved for	Yes for physical exam. The comprehensive HAZMAT Exams can be reimbursed through State Hazmat funds.

Municipal city	Annual Evaluatio n?	What is covered?	Mandator y?	Covered in a Collective Bargainin g Agreemen t?	Does the City receive the results?	Cost fully covered by the city?
	<p>Medical Clearance, N95 Fit Test, Mantoux). It also covers a mandatory comprehensive exam for all HAZMAT employees</p>	<p>screening, Mantoux, Qualitative Fit Test (N95)</p> <p>HAZMAT Employees: Blood tests, Urinalysis, Vision test, EKG, Chest x-ray</p> <p>Comprehensive cancer screening – in 2025 we will offer this to all employees. This will be voluntary, and the cost is covered by the employee.</p>			<p>Respiratory Use.”) - Any employee who receives “Respirator Use with Restrictions,” is sent to our occupational health provider for follow-up. Any employee who receives “Not Approved for Respiratory Use,” will be immediately removed from working on a rig, and put on Administrative Leave until cleared from occupational health.</p>	<p>Comprehensive cancer screening will be covered by the employee.</p>
<p>Raleigh, North Carolina</p>	<p>Our Employee Health Center conducts them annually.</p>	<p>General physical exam, blood tests, urinalysis, vision test, hearing screening, pulmonary function test, EKG, Chest x-ray, Cancer testing (PSA for >40 y.o., CA-125 for females, optional fecal</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>All results are stored securely in the Employee Health Center electronic medical record. The City itself does not have access to results. Anyone NOT “fit for duty” is reported to the</p>	<p>Yes</p>

Municipal ity	Annual Evaluatio n?	What is covered?	Mandator y?	Covered in a Collective Bargainin g Agreemen t?	Does the City receive the results?	Cost fully covered by the city?
		immunochemi cal testing for >40 y.o.)			Fire Department.	

In addition to the above research, the city also considered the National Fire Protection Association (NFPA) standard 1582, “Standard on Comprehensive Occupational Medical Program for Fire Departments.” The standard states: “Each medical evaluation shall include a medical history (including exposure history), physical examination, blood tests, urinalysis, vision tests, audiograms, spirometry, chest x-ray (as indicated), ECG, cancer screening (as indicated), and immunizations and infectious disease screening (as indicated).”

In order to estimate the cost of implementing an annual comprehensive exam, to include cancer testing, the City looked at several variables. First, the cost of CFD's 2019 comprehensive medical evaluation and cancer screening RFP was utilized. In 2019, CFD received a grant award in the amount of \$649,863.63. As a condition of the grant, the department was required to contribute funds equal to or greater than 10% of the award, or \$64,986.37, for a total budget of \$714,850. This budget was ultimately utilized in a competitive RFP process and for contract negotiations with the selected vendor.

In addition to considering the total cost in 2019, CFD reached out to the City of Columbus regarding the cost of their medical exam to utilize as a benchmark. While Columbus’ examination process is extensive and contains additional testing that the city is not considering at this time, CFD estimated a cost of approximately \$1,000,000 for the requested testing.

Based on the 2019 cost (adjusted for inflation) and the information received from Columbus, it is estimated that the comprehensive medical exam would cost approximately \$1,000,000. It is important to note that this cost would not be covered by the employee’s health insurance plan, rather this cost would be an additional expenditure that must be accounted for in CFD’s budget.

UPGRADE OF WORKOUT EQUIPMENT IN ALL 26 FIREHOUSES

Currently, all 26 fire stations have standardized city issued equipment. The following list was provided by CFD, outlining the current inventory of fitness equipment across all firehouses:

1. **38** Octane fitness ellipticals. There is one elliptical in every single engine house and two in our double houses.

2. **26** Cybex Arc trainers (Stair stepper/elliptical hybrid).
3. **26** Life fitness dual cable strength and conditioning equipment.
4. **26** Treadmills (Various vendors).

Regarding the age of the equipment, CFD relayed that the Arc trainers and Life fitness equipment are over 15 years old and have been extended beyond their life cycle. Additionally, CFD stated that the treadmill replacement cycle varies, as they are based on different replacement dates and are provided by various vendors.

The following shows a variety of cost estimates across several vendors, and includes a price range that is based on the make, model, and functionality of the equipment:

Vendor 1

Equipment	Low End of Price Range	High End of Price Range
Elliptical	\$3,999.99	\$10,370.00
Adaptive Motion Trainer ²	\$11,245.00	\$14,440.00
Functional Trainer ³	\$3,198.00	\$5,030.00
Treadmill	\$2,999.00	\$12,250.00

Low Total: \$605,491.62
 Median Total: \$912,135.81
 High Total: \$1,218,780.00

Vendor 2

Equipment	Low End of Price Range	High End of Price Range
Elliptical	\$2,190.00	\$4,399.00
Adaptive Motion Trainer	\$4,099.00	\$5,499.00
Functional Trainer	\$2,429.00	\$6,800.00
Treadmill	\$1,599.00	\$6,999.99

Low Total: \$294,522.00
 Median Total: \$481,728.87
 High Total: \$668,935.74

Vendor 3

Equipment	Low End of Price Range	High End of Price Range
Elliptical	\$3,275.00	\$5,999.00
Adaptive Motion Trainer	\$3,275.00	\$5,999.00
Functional Trainer	\$999.99	\$5,900.00
Treadmill	\$1,999.99	\$7,000.00

Low Total: \$287,599.48

² This piece of equipment is comparable to a Cybex Arc Trainer

³ This piece of equipment is comparable to Life Fitness Dual Cable Strength and Conditioning Equipment

Median Total: \$503,467.74
 High Total: \$719,336.00

Vendor 4⁴

Equipment	Low End of Price Range	High End of Price Range
Elliptical	\$2,960.00	N/A
Adaptive Motion Trainer	\$2,960.00	N/A
Functional Trainer	\$3,870.00	N/A
Treadmill	\$3,250.00	N/A

General Total: \$374,560.00

Overall Costs Across Vendors

Lowest Total	\$287,599.48
Average Low Total	\$390,543.28
Average Median Total	\$567,973.11
Average High Total	\$745,402.94
Highest Total	\$1,218,780.00

FUNDING FOR CERTIFICATION OF 15 FIREFIGHTERS AS HEALTH AND WELLNESS COACHES

While there are a multitude of Certified Health and Wellness Coach programs, this report outlines the anticipated cost of several certification programs that are approved by the National Board for Health and Wellness Coaching (NBHWC), which is the gold standard for health coach certification in the United States. Due to the large number of certification programs and the large variance in cost, it may be necessary for the city to engage in a competitive process before selecting a vendor.

Primal Health Coach Institute-Primal Health Coach Certification⁵

Overview of Program: The Primal Health Coach Institute takes a comprehensive approach to health coaching, including ancestral health and nutrition science, the art and science of coaching, and business development in its online curriculum. It is approved by the Health Coach Alliance and enrollees maintain lifetime access to all course materials and a subscription to the institute’s business resource center.

Primal Health Coach Institute’s program does not have any educational or professional prerequisites and can be completed entirely online and is self-paced. The institute estimates that if an enrollee spends five to seven hours a week (an average of one hour a day) working on the course, they can complete it successfully in six months.

⁴ Both Vendors 3 & 4 have minimal pricing information available, so these estimates are based on information of ranges online and prices off specific pieces of equipment included in submission of a recent RFP.

⁵ Source: <https://www.primalhealthcoach.com/primal-health-coach-certification/>

Cost: \$4,495 per person; Approximately \$67,425 total.

Catalyst Coaching Institute Wellness Coach Certification ⁶

Overview of Program: Catalyst Coaching Institute provides a fast track-style course that is self-paced, except for a two-day live virtual training session. After the completion of 12 interactive wellness webinars, three practice coaching sessions, a practical coaching skills assessment and a final exam, enrollees earn their Certified Wellness Coach (CWC) credential. Furthermore, the lessons are highly customizable, allowing enrollees to select 10 webinars that best fit their background, interests and intended client population.

This health coach certification program doesn't have any educational or professional prerequisites. However, in order to meet NBHWC requirements for becoming a board-certified health coach, individuals must also complete the Catalyst Coaching Institute Master Certified Wellness Training.

Cost: \$1,992 (Wellness Coach Certification only); Additional \$1,568 for the Master Certified Wellness Training; Approximately \$53,400 total.

American Fitness Professionals and Associates (AFPA) Certified Master Health and Wellness Coach Program ⁷

Overview of Program: AFPA provides a comprehensive NBHWC-approved program that is 100% online and contains a mix of self-paced learning and live, cohort-based learning. The course is structured to be completed in six months or less.

This certification program does not have any educational or professional prerequisites.

Cost: \$2,848 per person; Approximately \$42,720 total.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Annual Comprehensive Firefighter Occupational Health Exams, to include a Multi-Cancer Early Detection Test

Based on the NFPA standards, comparisons amongst other municipalities across the U.S., and the City Administration's desire to ensure the health and safety of its fire department personnel, it is recommended that the City move forward with implementation of annual comprehensive occupational health exams, to include comprehensive cancer screening, which may include multi-cancer early detection testing and/or additional screening methods. Based on the need to utilize the RFP process and to continue engaging in discussion with the Union, it is anticipated that the initial implementation of these exams would occur in FY2026.

The following are the recommended next steps:

⁶ Source: <https://www.catalystcoachinginstitute.com/>

⁷ Source: <https://www.afpafitness.com/product/certified-master-health-and-wellness-coach/>

CFD should work with the City’s Procurement office to solicit competitive proposals using a Request for Proposals (RFP). The RFP process will allow the City to weigh the relative merits of proposals submitted by competing vendors that meet the City’s quality requirements and to ensure that the feedback and concerns from the Union are taken into consideration. The RFP should contain a proposed budget to ensure that the department is able to properly account for the medical exams and testing in their annual budget. To date, CFD has met with Human Resources, Risk Management, and Local 48 in order to elicit feedback to assist in the drafting of the RFP.

It is recommended that the draft RFP is finalized as soon as possible to allow for public advertisement and submissions.

Proposed Milestones for the RFP Process:⁸

1. Drafting and finalization of RFP: February 1, 2025
2. Release of RFP: March 3, 2025
3. Submissions Due in Bonfire: March 24, 2025
4. City initiates negotiations with preferred Offeror: April 14, 2025
5. Notice of Award: June 1, 2025

Based on the data collected from surrounding municipalities, it is recommended that the comprehensive exams are mandatory and that the city receive a “fit for duty” determination following the annual examinations. This ensures all parties are aware that the employee has the ability to safely perform their currently assigned duties and allows the city to offer the necessary support to employees that may have medical restrictions due to a health condition. Prior to moving forward with negotiations and execution of a contract with the selected vendor, the City and Local 48 should meet to discuss implementing the terms and conditions of the annual comprehensive exams.⁹

Further, it is recommended that the costs of these examinations be included in CFD’s budget for Fiscal Year 2026. Based on the projected RFP timeline, it is anticipated that the initial comprehensive exams will begin in FY2026. As these exams will not be covered by the employee’s health insurance plan, the additional cost of the exams will need to be accounted for in CFD’s operating budget.

Upgrade of Workout Equipment in all 26 Firehouses

It is recommended that additional follow up is conducted prior to moving forward with purchasing new workout equipment in all 26 Firehouses. As noted above, the cost of replacement varies greatly based on the vendor and the make/model of the equipment. The following are recommended next steps:

⁸ The RFP process and discussion with the Union should occur simultaneously.

⁹ It should be noted that the City and Local 48 have previously met to discuss implementation of the CFD Respiratory Protection Program and Hearing Conservation Program, as required by OSHA. As such, the discussion with Local 48 should focus on the additional medical exams and testing that were requested by the Union.

CFD should evaluate and appropriately document the current state of their fitness equipment to include the age, appearance, maintenance, and user experience of the existing equipment. Following that evaluation, CFD should work with their Finance team and the Office of Budget and Evaluation to better determine the budgetary impact of replacement and whether there are existing funds that can be utilized to upgrade equipment and/or whether additional funding is needed. If it is determined that additional funding is needed, CFD should request the necessary funding in the upcoming budget cycle.

Funding for Certification of 15 Firefighters as Health and Wellness Coaches

It is recommended that additional follow up is conducted prior to moving forward with funding certification of firefighters as health and wellness coaches. The following are the recommended next steps:

CFD should work with the City's Procurement office to put out a Request for Information (RFI) in order to obtain additional information regarding the various Certification programs. This will give CFD and the Union a more comprehensive overview of the options, cost, and benefits of each certification program for their consideration.

The City should engage in additional dialogue with Local 48 to ensure that the City Administration has a full understanding of the Union's request and the goals of certifying 15 firefighters as health and wellness coaches. It is recommended that CFD and the Union work together to establish a written process that includes selection criteria, the requirements of those that are certified, as well as other potential components that should be included in a fitness and/or wellness program for CMO's consideration.